

**INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR ACCREDITATION AND RATING  
THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION**

*Addressed  
to the IAAR  
Council for accreditation*



**REPORT**

**on the results of the work of the external expert commission for assessing compliance with the  
standards of institutional accreditation**

**RSI “TEMIRBEK ZHURGENOV KAZAKH NATIONAL ACADEMY OF ARTS” CC MCS  
RK**

*Date of EEC visit: May 22-23, 2023*

**Almaty**

**May 23, 2023**

## Content

(I) LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS .....	3
(II) INTRODUCTION .....	4
(III) REPRESENTATION OF EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION.....	5
(VI) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE .....	5
(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC VISIT.....	5
(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION STANDARDS .....	6
6.1 STANDARD “STRATEGIC DEVELOPMENT AND QUALITY ASSURANCE” .....	6
6.2 STANDARD “LEADERSHIP AND MANAGEMENT”.....	8
6.3 STANDARD “INFORMATION MANAGEMENT AND REPORTING”.....	10
6.4 STANDARD “DEVELOPMENT AND APPROVAL OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS”.....	13
6.5 STANDARD “CONTINUOUS MONITORING AND PERIODIC EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS” .....	14
6.6 STANDARD “STUDENT-CENTERED LEARNING, TEACHING AND ASSESSMENT”.....	16
6.7 STANDARD “STUDENTS”.....	18
6.8 STANDARD “TEACHING STAFF” .....	20
6.9 STANDARD “RESEARCH WORK”.....	22
6.10 STANDARD “FINANCE”.....	24
6.11. STANDARD “EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES AND STUDENT SUPPORT SYSTEMS”.....	27
6.12. STANDARD “PUBLIC INFORMATION” .....	30
(VII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICE FOR EACH STANDARD .....	32
(VIII) OVERVIEW RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVING QUALITY FOR EACH STANDARD .....	33
(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION BOARD .....	35
<a href="#"><u>APPENDIX 1. ASSESSMENT TABLE "PARAMETERS OF INSTITUTIONAL PROFILE"</u></a> .....	36

## (I) LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

MES RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MCS RK	Ministry of Culture and Sports of the Republic of Kazakhstan
RSI	Republic State Institution
KazNAA	Kazakh national academy of arts
RD	regulatory documents
EP	educational program
GES	general educational subjects
BS	basic subjects
MS	major subjects
RO	registrar's office
MC	model curriculum
WC	working curriculum
EO	educational outcome
RW	research work
TS	teaching staff
EMCD	educational and methodological complex of the discipline
IWST	individual work of the student with the teacher
CNT	common national testing
CT	complex testing
IWS	individual work of the student
SRWS	scientific research work of students
QC	Qualifying commission
SCL	scientific-creative laboratory
RCPE	Research Center for Postgraduate Education
ISP	individual study plan
CED	catalog of elective disciplines
LLP	limited liability partnerships
SWOT	Strengths Weakness Opportunities Threats

## (II) INTRODUCTION

On May 22-23, 2023, an external expert commission of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (hereinafter - EEC) conducted an external quality assessment of the RSI “TEMIRBEK ZHURGENOV KAZAKH NATIONAL ACADEMY OF ARTS” CC MCS RK (hereinafter - T. Zhurgenov KazNAA) for compliance with the standards of institutional accreditation organizations of higher and (or) postgraduate education (Republic of Kazakhstan, approved and brought into force by order of the General Director of the Non-Profit Institution “Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating” dated June 16, 2020 No. 57-20-OD).

The work of the EEC was proceeded in accordance with the Program of the visit of the EEC for institutional accreditation, agreed by the rector of T. Zhurgenov KazNAA – A. Satybaldy, Chairman of the EEC G. Turtkarayeva, approved by the Director General of IAAR A. Zhumagulova on May 8, 2023.

The EEC report contains the result of an external quality assessment of T. Zhurgenov KazNAA, according to the standards of institutional accreditation, reflects strong positions in accordance with the criteria of the standards, recommendations of the EEC for further improvement, the conclusion of an external expert commission (Appendix 1), the visit program of the EEC (Appendix 2), the results of a survey of faculty members and students (Appendices 3- 4).

### **EEC composition:**

*Chairman of the EEC* - Turtkarayeva Gulnara Bayanovna, candidate of pedagogical sciences, associate professor of Ualikhanov University, expert of the 1st category, member of the Expert Commission on Higher Education IAAR (Kokshetau, Republic of Kazakhstan).

*IAAR expert* - Dzhumanova Lola Abduravifovna, candidate of art study, associate professor.

*IAAR expert, employer* - Abeldinov Adai Kunanbayevich, director of Adai production LLP (Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan).

*IAAR expert, student* - Sailau Meruert, a 3rd year student of the educational program 7M02179 Traditional Musical Art of the Kurmangazy Kazakh National Conservatory (Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan).

*EEC coordinator* - Niyazova Guliyash Balkenovna, Head of the Project for the institutional and specialized accreditation of higher educational institutions (universities) IAAR (Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan).

### **(III) ( REPRESENTATION OF EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION**

Temirbek Zhurgenov Kazakh national academy of arts was established in 1978 as the Alma-Ata State Theater and Art Institute. In 2001, the institution was given a special status “T.K. Zhurgenov Kazakh national academy of arts”.

Educational activities are carried out on the basis of license No. KZ14LAA00032929 dated December 12, 2022.

The Academy trains specialists in 25 bachelor's, 27 master's and 10 PhD educational programs.

The total staff of the teaching staff is 423 people, including 6 - doctors of science; 61 - candidates of sciences; 29 - PhD doctors; 10 professors of CCES (Committee for Control of Education and Science), 17 associate professors of CCES, 3 People's Artists, 32 Honored Artists and Honored Workers of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 12 people awarded state awards of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The academic degree holders rate of teaching staff is 40.3%.

The contingent of students is 2040 people, of which bachelor's degree - 1909 people, master's degree - 116 people, doctoral studies - 15 people.

In the Independent ranking of the demand for universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan - 2022, the academy is in the top five.

The Academy is a member of the international organization “Turksoy”, UNESCO, the Eurasian Cultural Union, the League of Asian Institutes of Arts, the Association of Higher Educational Institutions of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Association of Leading Film Schools “Bastau”.

The structure of the academy includes 2 educational buildings, a boarding school, a dormitory, a sports ground, a library.

### **(VI) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE**

In 2018, the RSI “Temirbek Zhurgenov Kazakh national academy of arts” underwent an external assessment for compliance with the standards of institutional accreditation of higher educational institutions implementing programs of higher and postgraduate education (approved and put into effect by order of the director of the Non-profit institution “Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating” No.10-17-OD dated February 24, 2017), according to the results of the assessment, it was accredited for 5 years.

EEC made 12 recommendations to improve the quality of the Academy, 10 recommendations were implemented, 2 recommendations require ongoing implementation.

External assessment of the RSI “Temirbek Zhurgenov Kazakh national academy of arts” for compliance with the standards of institutional accreditation of the organization of higher and (or) postgraduate education (Republic of Kazakhstan, approved and brought into force by the order of the General Director of the Non-profit institution “Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating” from 16’ June 2020 No. 57-20-OD) is held for the first time.

### **(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC VISIT**

On May 22-23, 2023, the RSI “Temirbek Zhurgenov Kazakh national academy of arts” of the MKS RK was assessed for compliance with the quality standards of institutional accreditation of an organization of higher and (or) postgraduate education (approved and brought into force by order of the general director of the non-profit institution “Independent agency for accreditation and rating” dated June 16, 2020 No. 57-20-OD).

To coordinate the work of the EEC, on May 21, a kick-off meeting was held, during which powers were distributed among the members of the commission, the schedule of the visit was specified, and agreement was reached on the choice of examination methods.

In compliance with the requirements of the standards, the program of the visit included meetings with the rector, vice-rectors, heads of structural divisions, deans, heads of university departments, teachers, students, graduates, employers and employees from various departments, interviews and questionnaires for teachers and students. A total of 182 people took part in the meetings (Table 1).

Table 1. *Information about employees and students who took part in meetings with the EEC IAAR*

Category of participants	Number
Rector	1
Vice-rectors	3
Deans	6
Heads of structural divisions and departments	14
Heads of Chairs (departments)	24
Teaching staff	43
Students, master and PhD students	71
Alumnus	13
Employers	7
Overall (in total)	<b>182</b>

EEC members attended academic studies(classes) and exams:

- classes in the discipline “Acting Art” (teacher Turankulova Darikha, Honored Artist of Kazakhstan, Work on a graduation performance); “Musical sound engineering” (teacher Belov Vladimir Viktorovich, Work of a sound engineer with performers; “Pedagogy of choreography” (teacher Gabbasova Gulnara, artist Theory and methods of teaching folk stage dance); “Pedagogy of modern choreography” (teacher .Gabbasova Gulnara, artist Methodological foundations of teaching dance Contemporary); “Pop vocal” (teacher Kanlybaev Daulet; Mukhsynova Meruert; Individual classes).

During the excursion, the members of the EEC got acquainted with the state of the material and technical base: they visited the scientific library, museum, classrooms, laboratories, specialized rooms, computer classes, research institute and centres, departments, departments, canteen, sports halls, etc.

Put in place all the necessary arrangements for the work of the EEC, access to all necessary information resources was organized. On the part of the Academy staff, the presence of all the persons indicated in the visit program was ensured in compliance with the established time period.

As part of the planned program, recommendations for improving the activities of the university, developed by the EEC based on the results of the examination, were presented at a meeting with the leadership on May 23, 2023.

## **(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION STANDARDS**

### **6.1 Standard “Strategic development and quality assurance”**

✓ *Higher educational institution must demonstrate the development of a unique strategy based on the analysis of external and internal factors with the wide involvement of various stakeholders.*

✓ *Higher educational institution must demonstrate the orientation of the mission, vision and strategy to meet the needs of the state, society, sectors of the real economy, potential employers, students and other stakeholders.*

✓ *Higher educational institution must demonstrate the transparency of the processes of formation, monitoring and regular review of the mission, vision, and strategy and quality assurance policy.*

✓ *Higher educational institution must have a published quality assurance policy, mission and strategy.*

✓ *Higher educational institution develops documents on individual areas of activity and processes (plans, programs, regulations, etc.), specifying the quality assurance policy.*

✓ *The quality assurance policy should reflect the relationship between research, teaching and learning.*

✓ *Higher educational institution must demonstrate the development of a culture of quality assurance.*

### ***Evidence-based part***

The analysis of the self-assessment report, additional materials and the results of meetings with target groups lead to the following conclusions.

In implementation of the mission and vision, the Development Strategy of T.K. Zhurgenov KazNAA for 2016–2026, approved by the Academic Council of the Academy (record No.4 dated May 26, 2016). The development strategy defines the strategic goals, values, main vectors, development priorities of the academy and expected results. To improve the competitiveness of the university, an analysis of the external and internal environment is periodically carried out. Based on the results of the analysis carried out in 2016 during the development of the KazNAA Development Strategy, a SWOT analysis was prepared and threats and risks to the development of the academy were identified.

The vision, mission and strategy of the university are consistent with each other and correspond to the available resources. The university has convincingly demonstrated the orientation of the mission, vision and strategy to meet the needs of the state, society, sectors of the economy, potential employers, students and other stakeholders.

The Academy has developed, approved and is implementing the Academic Quality Policy (approved by the Academic Council on October 29, 2020, record No.3), which is specified in internal regulatory documents and is an integral element of the strategic management of the university, the basis for planning and organizing all areas of the university, including educational and research activities.

The Academy quality assurance policy is developed in accordance with the mission, vision and strategic goals of the academy, takes into account the national context, in particular the state policy in the field of culture, the goals and objectives of the national education system, as well as the internal university context and available resources. Quality goals are specified annually and include specific quantitative indicators that allow monitoring their implementation (Quality goals for the 2022–2023 academic year, Record of the Academic Council No.1, 08/31/2022).

The Academy has demonstrated a focus on developing a culture of quality and values within the university, as well as concrete steps taken to develop a regulatory framework for the continuous improvement of the quality of education at the university. Availability, transparency and openness of the strategic documents of the university and, in particular, documents related to the quality assurance policy for all interested parties were ensured through their placement on the official website of the Academy in the public domain (<https://kaznai.kz/wp-content/uploads>).

During the scheduled visit to the university the interviews with various categories, the EEC members found that the processes of formation, monitoring, revision of the mission, vision, strategy and quality assurance policy are carried out by the university transparently and on a regular basis. The leadership of KazNAA has demonstrated the involvement in the development of the Strategic Plan and the implementation of the quality assurance policy of all stakeholders, including graduates and employers.

The Academy has created and operates a feedback mechanism with consumers of educational services, which is used to determine the degree of implementation of its own mission, goals and objectives, performance assessment of activities of the academy, and also to identify opportunities for improving the services provided. Thus, the Academy collects and analyses data on a regular basis, in particular, through annual sociological surveys among teaching staff and students, to identify the degree of satisfaction with various aspects of the university's activities. The results of the analysis are considered at various levels and serve as the basis for subsequent adjustments.

As a result of an anonymous survey of teaching staff during the visit of the EEC to the university, it was revealed that 97.7% of respondents were satisfied with the level of involvement of teaching staff in the process of making managerial and strategic decisions, estimating this process as “very good” 42.9% or “good” 54.8 %.

### ***Analytic part***

As a result of the analysis of the level of compliance of the Academy’s activities with the criteria of this standard, the EEC found that KazNAA has an effective system of planning and workflow to control and monitor the implementation of the mission of the university and the qualitative fulfilment of its goals.

The Academy self-assessment report lists a number of possible risks identified by the university during the preparation of the Development Strategy for 2016–2026 based on an analysis of external and internal factors. In turn, the KazNAA Development Strategy for 2016-2026 lists a number of measures that are aimed at preventing the identified risks. At the same time, *the mechanism for preventing or minimizing the listed possible risks is not fully disclosed, and the identified measures do not cover all the listed risks.*

### ***Strengths/best practice***

*Was not revealed*

### ***EEC recommendation:***

*To organize by 2024 the process of analysing the identified possible risks with the identification of specific measures to prevent or minimize each of them.*

### ***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:***

*According to the standard “Strategic development and quality assurance”, 7 criteria are disclosed, of which 7 have a satisfactory position.*

## **6.2 Standard “Leadership and management”**

✓ *Higher educational institution carries out management processes, including planning and allocation of resources in accordance with the strategy.*

✓ *Higher educational institution must demonstrate the successful functioning and improvement of the internal quality assurance system.*

✓ *Higher educational institution must demonstrate a risk management analysis.*

✓ *Higher educational institution must demonstrate the analysis of the effectiveness of changes.*

✓ *Higher educational institution must demonstrate an analysis of the identified inconsistencies, the implementation of the developed corrective and preventive actions.*

✓ *Higher educational institution must demonstrate a clear definition of those responsible for business processes, an unambiguous distribution of staff duties, and delimitation of the functions of collegial bodies.*



✓ *An important factor is to ensure the management of the educational process through the management of educational programs, including the evaluation of their effectiveness.*

✓ *Higher educational institution demonstrates the development of annual action plans, including teaching staff, based on the development strategy.*

✓ *Commitment to quality assurance should apply to any activity performed by contractors and partners (outsourcing), including the implementation of joint/double-degree education and academic mobility.*

✓ *Higher educational institution must provide evidence of the transparency of the HEI management system.*

✓ *Higher educational institution must ensure the participation of students and teaching staff in the work of collegial governing bodies.*

✓ *Higher educational institution must demonstrate evidence of the demonstrativeness and accessibility of managers and administration for students, teaching staff, parents and other relevant parties.*

✓ *Higher educational institution must demonstrate innovation management, including the analysis and implementation of innovative proposals.*

✓ *Higher educational institution should strive to participate in international, national and regional professional alliances, associations, etc.*

✓ *Higher educational institution should provide training for management (rector, advisers, vice-rectors, deans, heads of structural divisions, and heads of departments) on education management programs.*

✓ *The institution should strive to ensure that the progress made since the last external quality assurance procedure is taken into account when preparing for the next procedure.*

### ***Evidence-based part***

Based on the self-assessment report and the materials studied during the visit, the EEC notes that the Academy management system is focused on the development and implementation of strategic planning, the use of modern management methods, in particular elements of corporate management, continuous improvement of management processes, as well as the achievement of the planned target indicators. Management activity and its functioning in the RSI “Temirbek Zhurgenov Kazakh national academy of arts” is based on the creation of the organizational structure of the university, approved by the rector on 11/01/2021, ensuring the unity of sustainable relationships between structural units that carry out the activities necessary to achieve the goals set by the Development Strategy.

The Academy has created and operates various collegiate governing bodies (Academic Council, Rectorate, Academic Committee, Educational and Methodological Board, Council of Young Scientists, Committee on Youth Affairs, etc.), which have clearly defined functions and act in accordance with existing regulations. The role of collegiate bodies in making decisions on the main issues of the functioning and development of the university, as a result of their discussion at their meetings, is significant.

Having studied the documentation of the Academy, the experts were convinced that KazNAA has developed, in accordance with national regulations, and applies internal documents regulating the management of educational activities through the management of the EP (“Guidelines for the design of modular educational programs”, approved by the EMB (record No.3 of 06.11. 2020, “Academic policy of KazNAA”, approved by the Academic Council (record No.10 dated 05/27/2021) The EP management mechanism includes planning, implementation, quality assurance, monitoring, control over the implementation of the EP and performance assessment.

Academy management and administration are available to students, teaching staff and other interested parties. To obtain objective information about the activities of the university in various aspects, the possibility of making proposals for improving the activities of the university, there is a rector's blog on the website of the Academy ([www.kaznai.kz](http://www.kaznai.kz)) and other tools for monitoring the management process. The feedback channels existing at the Academy provide an opportunity for all participants in the educational process to contact the leadership with problems, initiatives and

suggestions.

The Academy demonstrates evidence of the openness and accessibility of leaders and administration to students, teaching staff, parents and other interested parties, including through the website and social networks. In particular, in the course of an anonymous survey conducted by the EEC, 97.6% of the interviewed teaching staff highly rated the level of feedback from the teaching staff with the management, of which “very good” - 52.4% and “good” - 45.2%.

The participation of teaching staff and students in the management of the Academy is ensured by their right to be elected to collegiate management bodies, to make proposals for improving the educational process. All members of the collegiate bodies of the Academy have the right to vote, can freely express their opinions, make proposals, etc.

### ***Analytic part***

The EEC notes that despite the fact that aspects of managing the innovation activity of the Academy are scheduled and regulated, they are mainly focused on obtaining patents and copyright certificates. At the same time, *during the visit, the Academy management did not provide confirmation of the analysis of innovations for the last academic year on all topics being introduced.*

*The experts could not verify the existence of formalized records demonstrating the regular analysis and elimination of identified inconsistencies found in the framework of internal inspections and audits, the process of measuring the degree of satisfaction with the needs of students, teaching staff, staff and the implementation of the developed corrective and preventive actions.*

The Academy provides on a regular basis the conditions for improving the qualifications of the teaching staff and *the passage of the leadership of the Academy, structural divisions and EP training in education management programs.*

### ***Strengths/best practice***

- participation in international, national and regional professional alliances, associations, etc.

### ***EEC recommendations:***

To provide an analysis of innovations for the last academic year on all topics being introduced.

To develop a mechanism for corrective and preventive actions in order to eliminate deficiencies identified as part of the process of measuring the degree of satisfaction with the needs of teaching staff, staff and students, as well as within the framework of internal audits (until 2024).

### ***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:***

*According to the standard “Leadership and Management”, 15 criteria are disclosed, of which 1 has a strong position, 11 is satisfactory and 3 require improvement.*

## **6.3 Standard “Information management and reporting”**

✓ *The HEI must ensure the functioning of the system for collecting, analysing and managing information based on the use of modern information and communication technologies and software.*

✓ *The HEI must demonstrate the systematic use of processed, adequate information to improve the internal quality assurance system.*

✓ *The HEI should have a system of regular reporting at all levels of the organizational structure, including an assessment of the effectiveness and efficiency of the activities of departments, EP (curriculums), scientific research and their interaction.*

✓ *The HEI must establish the frequency, forms and methods for assessing the management of the EP (educational programs), the activities of collegial bodies and structural divisions, top management, and the implementation of research projects.*

✓ *The HEI must demonstrate the determination of the procedure and ensuring the protection of information, including the identification of persons responsible for the reliability and timeliness of the analysis of information and the provision of data.*

✓ *An important factor is the involvement of students, employees and teaching staff in the processes of collecting and analysing information, as well as making decisions based on them.*

✓ *The HEI must demonstrate the existence of a mechanism for communication with students, employees and other stakeholders, including the existence of mechanisms for resolving conflicts.*

✓ *The HEI must provide a measurement of the degree of satisfaction with the needs of teaching staff, staff and students and demonstrate evidence of the elimination of identified shortcomings.*

✓ *The HEI should evaluate the effectiveness and efficiency of its activities, including in the context of the EP.*

✓ *The information collected and analysed by the university should take into account:*

- *key performance indicators;*

- *the dynamics of the contingent of students in the context of forms and types;*

- *performance, achievements level of students and expulsion;*

- *satisfaction of students with the implementation of the EP and the quality of education at the HEI;*

- *availability of educational resources and support systems for students;*

- *employment and career growth of graduates.*

✓ *Students, employees and teaching staff must document their consent to the processing of personal data.*

✓ *The HEI should contribute to providing all the necessary information in the relevant fields of science.*

### ***Evidence-based part***

KazNAA uses modern information and communication technologies and software tools to automate the processes of collecting, analyzing and managing information. The university manages its own multi-page corporate website (<https://kaznai.kz/>), which contains information on the main components of the Academy's activities in three languages. For information support of the main processes of operational and strategic management of the university, AIS "Platonus" (<http://platonus.kaznai.kz/>) and LMS "MOODLE" (<https://edu.kaznai.kz>) are used. The system provides the ability to manage the academic calendar, the formation of individual plans, the placement of teaching materials, the formation of examination sheets, examination testing of students in the classroom, and questioning.

The academy has an information website [www.talapker.kz](http://www.talapker.kz) for applicants, where information on educational (study) programs, admission rules, exam schedule, consultation time and a list of documents are updated annually.

The Academy provides free access to Wi-Fi for teachers and students throughout the university, including in academic buildings and dormitories. The buildings of the university are connected to a digital security video surveillance system.

KazNAA has developed and is implementing a system of regular reporting at all levels. Prepared reports are heard at meetings of collegiate bodies, and based on the results of the discussion, the ongoing activities are evaluated, decisions are made on planning and implementing corrective actions, the implementation of which is aimed at achieving the strategic priorities of the Academy.

The Academy has an internal workflow system based on the Platonus Workflow tool, which allows you to correctly distribute the working time of each employee who is involved in the approval or verification of any process. It saves time and makes paperless.

The Academy is taking measures to constantly monitor compliance with the standards of academic integrity in accordance with the adopted Rules of Academic Integrity, approved by the Board of Studies on 08.28.2020, as well as monitoring the corruption situation in the relationship

between students and teaching staff. The Academy has established the Anti-Corruption and Youth Policy Service.

The resolution of the conflicts that have arisen is carried out through constructive negotiations with the participation of the parties to the conflict and a special commission, which includes representatives of the administration and heads of structural divisions.

The Commission notes that to assess the effectiveness of the implementation of the educational process, QMS mechanisms, internal and external audits are used, and corrective actions with deadlines and performers are developed to eliminate identified inconsistencies. In addition, the assessment of the effectiveness and efficiency of the implementation of the EP is determined based on feedback and petitions provided by employers (90% of employers are satisfied with the quality of graduate training). To improve the quality of training of students, improve and develop educational programs, monitoring of satisfaction with the implementation of the EP of students is carried out. Students, teaching staff and employees confirm their consent to the processing of personal data.

In general, the commission notes that the Academy uses modern information systems, information and communication technologies and software in order to adequately manage information. Based on the analysis of the facts, the university management evaluates the effectiveness and efficiency of the implementation of educational programs, demonstrates sound decision-making and identifies opportunities for improving its quality.

### ***Analytic part***

The analysis of compliance with the criteria of this standard allowed the EEC to conclude that the information collection and management system operating in KazNAA, the reporting system and the supported databases are favourable for compiling various reports and analytical reports.

During conversations with teaching staff, students and other stakeholders, the EEC noted that at the Academy level, these categories are regularly involved in the processes of collecting and analysing information, as well as making decisions based on them. The teaching staff and students annually participate in anonymous surveys on various topics, including to determine the degree of satisfaction of the teaching staff and students with the quality of educational services, management activities, etc. To provide feedback, informal meetings are also organized, meetings with the rector, also there is the rector's blog operates on the website of the Academy.

At the same time, EEC members note that the *Academy needs to continue further work to involve students, employees, teaching staff, graduates and employers in the process of collecting and analysing information, as well as making decisions based on them.*

The results of these processes require greater formalization and coverage in various documents being developed (protocols, analytical reports, reports, decisions of various collegiate bodies, etc.) with subsequent informing of interested stakeholders, including through the website of the Academy.

The Commission also notes *the insufficient work on evaluating the effectiveness and efficiency of the EP, ensuring the analysis and information security.*

### ***Strengths/best practice***

Was not revealed

### ***EEC recommendation:***

Develop and implement a clear mechanism for informing all stakeholders about the decisions taken by the Academy management based on the results of the analysis of feedback data (until 2024).

Determine the persons responsible for the procedure for evaluating the effectiveness and efficiency of the EP; ensuring the reliability and timeliness of the analysis of information and the provision of data, ensuring the protection of information (until the end of 2023).

### **Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:**

*According to the Information Management and Reporting standard, 17 criteria are disclosed, of which 16 have a satisfactory position, 1 needs to be improved*

### **6.4 Standard “Development and approval of educational programs”**

- ✓ *The HEI must define and document the procedures for the development of EPs and their approval at the institutional level.*
- ✓ *The HEI must demonstrate the compliance of the developed EP with the established goals, including the expected learning outcomes.*
- ✓ *The HEI must demonstrate the availability of developed models of the EP graduate that describe learning outcomes and personal qualities.*
- ✓ *The HEI must demonstrate the conduct of external expertise of the EP.*
- ✓ *The qualification obtained upon completion of the EP must be clearly defined, explained and correspond to a certain level of NQS (National qualifications system).*
- ✓ *The HEI should determine the influence of disciplines and professional practices on the formation of learning outcomes.*
- ✓ *An important factor is the possibility of preparing students for professional certification.*
- ✓ *The HEI must provide evidence of the participation of students, teaching staff and other stakeholders in the development of the EP, ensuring their quality.*
- ✓ *The labour intensity of the EP should be clearly defined in Kazakhstani credits and ECTS.*
- ✓ *The HEI must provide the content of academic disciplines and learning outcomes for the level of education (bachelor's, master's, doctoral studies).*
- ✓ *The structure of the EP should provide for various types of activities corresponding to the learning outcomes.*
- ✓ *An important factor is the presence of joint EPs with foreign educational organizations.*

#### **Evidence-based part**

The academy has established a procedure for the development and approval of the EP. The procedures for developing and assessing the quality of the EP are documented, the frequency, forms and methods for assessing the quality of the EP, requirements are determined. In order to manage modular academic program, the academy developed Methodological recommendations for the development of modular educational programs, which were considered at a meeting of the Academy's Educational and Methodological Council (minutes No. 3 dated 11/06/2020).

Currently, the Academy is preparing for 25 educational programs of undergraduate, 27 - master's, 10 - doctoral studies. Educational programs are compiled based on legislative acts in force in the field of education.

To design an educational program, a working group is created consisting of teaching staff, students and employers (for example, the director of the Astana Musical Theater Islam Nurtazin - EP “Acting Art”, the director of “Theatre BT”– Aigul Sultanbekova EP “Theatre Management”), a program manager is appointed. The developed EP goes through several stages of discussion: at the level of the department with the participation of employers, students, teaching staff of the department; at the level of the Educational Methodological Council.

The renewal of the EP is carried out taking into account the interests of the labour market. For instance, on the proposition of the employer-director of the Astana Musical Theatre from the profile of the EP “Actor of the Musical Theatre”, the disciplines “solfeggio” and “piano” were reduced and the volume of hours for vocals was increased, which was replaced from academic to pop vocal.

The Academy has developed mechanisms for internal quality assessment and examination of educational programs. Leading employees or heads of organizations and enterprises whose work

profile corresponds to the profile of the educational program carry out examination of educational programs. For instance, the following were involved in the examination of EP 6B02178 “Pedagogy of choreography”: Vice-rector for educational and methodological work of the Kazakh National Academy of Choreography, Honored Worker of the Republic of Kazakhstan – Alisheva A.T.

For each EP, a development plan is drawn up, in the formation of which students, teaching staff and employers are involved. Based on public discussion in academic groups, at meetings of departments and the educational and methodological council of the academy, changes, proposals and amendments are made.

During development the graduate model, the opinions of students and employers are taken into account.

In general, the Academy determined the content, volume, logic of building an individual educational trajectory for students, taking into account the influence of disciplines and professional practices on the formation of professional competence of graduates.

Harmonization of the EP with the educational programs of foreign universities is carried out in the form of the development of joint EPs with foreign universities. T. Zhurgenov KazNAA signed an agreement with the Azerbaijan University of Art and Culture for the development of the master's degree program “Art History”, the implementation of which is scheduled for the 2023-2024 academic year.

### ***Analytic part***

During the visit, the experts analysed educational programs, educational and methodological support for their implementation. The documentation was developed in accordance with internal university educational and methodological documents and regulatory requirements of the Republic of Kazakhstan. At the same time, experts note that the *Academy has not demonstrated the presence of a scientific aspect in the content of educational programs.*

Members of the EEC note the *insufficient work of the Academy to provide students with the opportunity to pass through professional certification.*

### ***Strengths/best practice***

- The Academy determines the influence of disciplines and professional practices on the formation of learning outcomes.

### ***EEC recommendation:***

To supplement the content of the EP with research elements (until the end of 2024).

The leadership of the EP to start purposeful work on organizing the preparation of students for professional certification.

### ***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:***

*According to the standard “Development and approval of educational programs”, 11 criteria are disclosed, of which 1 has a strong position, 10 are satisfactory.*

## **6.5 Standard “Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of the educational programs”**

✓ *The HEI should monitor and periodically evaluate the EP in order to ensure the achievement of the goal and meet the needs of students and society. The results of these processes are aimed at continuous improvement of the EP.*

✓ *Monitoring and periodic evaluation of the EP should consider:*

- *the content of the programs in the light of the latest achievements of science in a particular discipline to ensure the relevance of the discipline taught;*



- changes in the requirements alteration of society and the professional environment;
- workload, academic performance and graduation of students;
- the effectiveness of student assessment procedures;
- expectations, needs and satisfaction of students with EP training;
- the educational environment and support services and their compliance with the objectives of the EP.

✓ The HEI must provide evidence of the participation of students, employers and other stakeholders in the revision of the SP.

✓ All stakeholders must be informed of any planned or undertaken actions in relation to the EP. All changes made to the EP must be published.

✓ The HEI must ensure the revision of the content and structure of the EP, taking into account changes in the labour market, the requirements of employers and the social demand of society.

### ***Evidence-based part***

The study of internal regulatory documents, records of meetings of collegiate bodies, the results of questioning teachers and students, the results of meetings and interviews confirmed that the Academy monitors and periodically evaluates accredited EPs.

The educational programs implemented at the Academy have clearly defined goals that are consistent with the mission of the Academy, the National Qualification System. Information about the number of EPs, its content and a description of the core competencies as learning outcomes are available on the Academy website.

Employers and students participate in the development and evaluation of educational programs. All incoming information is carefully analysed and appropriate measures are taken by the Academy management.

The Academy provides a revision of the content of the educational program, taking into account the requirements of the labour market, employers and students. For example, the discipline “Modern trends in the film and television process” was included in the educational program “Directing” at the request of the students. At the request of employers and the demand of the modern film industry, the profile of the EP “Cinema Artist” was developed, which includes the training of performers of stunt tricks.

Employers, for example, carry out external evaluation of educational programs the theatre of modern dance “Samruk”, the Kazakh National Academy of Choreography, A. Seleznev Almaty Choreographic School and others.

Evaluation of the expected results of the implementation of the EP is carried out by questioning and feedback from students. The results of monitoring and periodic evaluation of educational programs make it possible to purposefully improve the content of the studied disciplines, teaching methods, teaching strategy and study of subjects, which enhances the practical orientation of the study program, taking into account the requirements of the labour market.

AIS “Platonus” is used to store and process information about the progress of students, records in the transcript. The processed data indicate that the selected content, forms and methods of studying the proposed courses contribute to the successful formation of competencies necessary for the further professional activities of graduates. The work on conducting intramural control, monitoring the satisfaction of employers with the quality of training of specialists and reviewing the results of monitoring the knowledge of study groups and courses allows us to assess the quality of the EP.

### ***Analytic part***

During the visit of the EEC, educational programs were studied, which were drawn up in accordance with the intramural methodological recommendations and meet the general regulatory requirements of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The content of the programs is developed taking into account the latest achievements of science and changes in the needs of society, thereby ensuring its relevance.

Employers take part in the development of the EP by submitting their proposals for new elective

disciplines, but a procedure for regular monitoring of employers' satisfaction with graduates has not been developed, which would make it possible to determine the strengths and weaknesses of the learning outcomes and content of the EP.

Experts note the lack of awareness of employers, students and other stakeholders about changes in the EP.

***Strengths/best practice***

Was not revealed

***EEC recommendation:***

To develop a procedure for monitoring employers' satisfaction with the quality of graduate training (until 2024).

Promptly inform employers, students and other interested parties about changes in the EP.

***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:***

*According to the standard “Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of educational programs”, 11 criteria are disclosed, of which 11 have a satisfactory position.*

**6.6 Standard “Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment”**

✓ *The HEI must ensure respect and attention to the various groups of students and their needs, providing them with flexible learning paths.*

✓ *The HEI must ensure the use of various forms and methods of teaching and learning.*

✓ *An important factor is the presence of own research in the field of teaching methods of academic disciplines.*

✓ *The HEI must demonstrate the existence of a feedback system on the use of various teaching methods and the assessment of learning outcomes.*

✓ *The institution must demonstrate support for learner autonomy while providing guidance and assistance from the teacher.*

✓ *The HEI must demonstrate the existence of a procedure for responding to complaints from students.*

✓ *The HEI must ensure the consistency, transparency and objectivity of the mechanism for assessing learning outcomes, including appeal.*

✓ *The HEI must ensure that the procedures for assessing the learning outcomes of students correspond to the planned learning outcomes and program goals. Criteria and evaluation methods should be published in advance.*

✓ *The HEI should determine the mechanisms for ensuring the development of learning outcomes by each graduate and ensure the completeness of their formation.*

✓ *Assessors should be proficient in modern methods of evaluating learning outcomes and regularly improve their skills in this area.*

***Evidence-based part***

As part of student-centred learning, the Academy uses various teaching methods and technologies that are aimed at meeting the needs, requests and learning opportunities. At the same time, the assessment of knowledge demonstrates the degree of formation of competencies and is determined by compliance with the planned learning outcomes.

To achieve the appropriate level of knowledge, the Academy uses such methods and forms of teaching as lecture group and practical classes. Lecture group classes are used for the disciplines of the



art history cycle, while practical classes that have group, small group or individual forms are determined by the specifics of each specific educational program and its content.

At the same time, lectures use problem-based learning methods, case study methods, polemical methods, facilitation methods, etc. The training programs widely use digital learning opportunities, namely digital applications Quizlet.com, learningApps.org, Kahoot.com, as well as Google service programs.

Among the teaching methods, it is necessary to note innovative approaches that make it possible to use project-based teaching methods in the implementation of creative disciplines, using students from different faculties, for example, screenwriters, producers, make-up artists, actors, cameramen, directors and sound engineers, in the implementation of each of them. Film critic and director A. Mashurova presented such a project. Another example of this kind of collaboration project, the authors of which were teachers G. Gabbasova and R. Kosay, the essence of which is the joint implementation of the project by students and teachers of the faculties of choreography and cinema and TV. These experiments allow students to get practical work skills as close as possible to real conditions. No less interesting was the experience of the teacher B. Mukhitdenova in modelling a real professional situation. So, a recording lesson (within the discipline of “vocal production”) is organized with the real participation of the performer of the recorded work, music producer and sound engineer. Students of the corresponding profiles of study perform all these “specializations”.

In a conversation with the teaching staff, it was especially emphasized that the cultivation of individuality, originality, characteristic style, and the development of one's own “handwriting” is a red thread in training. All these qualities are necessary for future specialists in creative professions. To develop such qualities, the teaching staff provides guidance and assistance in setting creative goals, excluding authoritarianism and emasculation of an individual creative style.

All assessment formats at the stages of current, midterm and final control with the developed criteria and methods of assessment, indicated in the syllabuses of disciplines, are placed in LSM Moodle as separate documents for the convenience of students. Students are familiar with these materials from the very beginning of the training period.

For the convenience of the teaching staff and students, by the beginning of the examination session, instructions are posted indicating the criteria for evaluating all forms of test tests. Criteria for evaluating theses and projects are placed in the Regulations on the thesis.

Ensuring that graduates master the learning outcomes of the EP is based on the principle of phased control in a built-in chain: current control - achievement of PTO (professional teaching outcomes) classes, midterm control - achievement of PTO in modules, intermediate control - achievement of PTO in the discipline, final certification - achievement of PTO in EP.

### ***Analytic part***

The listed activities to achieve the best results in teaching students allow us to draw the following conclusions.

1. KazNAA has developed methods for monitoring students' knowledge, a mechanism for conducting practice-oriented disciplines.
2. The EEC members noted that there is an impulse to introduce their own teaching methods for teaching staff, but this work requires considerable material costs and scientific justification.
3. A survey of students conducted during the EEC IAAR visit showed that students evaluate
  - the speed of response to feedback from teachers on the educational process is fully satisfied - 77.3%;
  - informing the requirements in order to successfully complete this educational program - 77.3%;
  - objective assessment of knowledge, skills and other educational achievements - 77.3%.

### ***Strengths/best practice***

- the use of various forms and methods of teaching in training;
- availability of feedback on the use of various teaching methods and evaluation of learning outcomes;

- the presence of own research in the field of teaching methods of academic disciplines;
- demonstrating support for learner autonomy with simultaneous guidance and assistance from the teacher.

***EEC recommendation:***

*There is no recommendation*

***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:***

*According to the standard “Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment”, 10 criteria are disclosed, of which 4 have a strong position and 6 are satisfactory.*

**6.7 Standard “Students”**

✓ *The HEI must demonstrate the policy of forming a contingent of students from admission to graduation and ensure the transparency of its procedures. The procedures governing the life cycle of students (from admission to completion) must be defined, approved, published. The HEI should provide for special adaptation and support programs for newly enrolled and foreign students.*

✓ *The HEI must demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention.*

✓ *The HEI should cooperate with other educational organizations and national centres of the “European Network of National Information Centres for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information Centres” ENIC / NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications.*

✓ *The HEI must demonstrate the existence and application of a mechanism for recognizing the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of additional, formal and non-formal education.*

✓ *The HEI should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of students, as well as assist them in receiving external grants for education.*

✓ *The HEI should make every effort to provide students with internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and maintain contact with them.*

✓ *The HEI must provide graduates with documents confirming the qualifications obtained, including the learning outcomes achieved, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion.*

✓ *An important factor is the monitoring of employment and professional activities of graduates.*

✓ *The HEI should actively encourage students to self-education and development outside the main program (extracurricular activities).*

✓ *An important factor is the existence of an active alumni association.*

✓ *An important factor is the existence of a mechanism to support gifted students.*

***Evidence-based part***

Analysis of the submitted self-report of T. Zhurgenov KazNAA and meetings with all levels of structures providing the educational process showed that the Academy has created an educational environment that takes into account the interests and needs of students at all stages of their life cycle. On the website of the university, the rules governing all periods of study, starting from admission to the Academy, are published. All documents on the regulation of the educational process are aimed at the consistent development of the student's academic career, his progress along the educational trajectory, involvement in the educational process, taking into account individual needs and opportunities for personal development.

The admission procedure to KazNAA is carried out in accordance with the Model Admission Rules for training in educational organizations that implement EPs of higher and postgraduate education, approved by order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan

No. 600 dated 10/31/2018. It is based on the principles of openness and transparency.

Taking into account the specifics of a creative HEI, the examination committee reveals the applicant's inclination towards the direction of training and recommends enrolment in a specific training profile, taking into account the indicators.

Admission to undergraduate studies is based on an interview. Here, applicants have a secondary general, secondary technical or higher education. Admission to the master's program is carried out on a competitive basis based on the results of comprehensive testing and creative exams.

Implementing the contingent support policy, the Academy management conducts an orientation week, during which it acquaints students with the rules of credit learning technologies, the knowledge assessment system, the rules for transferring from course to course, GPA calculation, internal regulations, as well as the rules of living in a hostel. For these purposes, the Academy organizes the work of advisors.

The student support policy also includes the possibility of deferred payment or tuition discounts for students on a fee basis.

The Academy pays special attention to the issues of adaptation and support for foreign students. In particular, they are assisted in nostrification and apostille of documents. Guidebooks have been created for them, containing the necessary systematized brief information. For the social adaptation of foreign students, the adaptation program includes a number of activities that accompany the life cycle of students (starting from meeting at the airport and registering at the Office of the Migration Service of the Police Department in Almaty and ending with monitoring their attendance).

For the procedure for recognizing learning outcomes obtained through formal or non-formal education, the Academy has established a special commission of an odd number of members. Based on certificates, additional modules of the EP within the framework of MAJOR, MINOR can be recognized. To recognize the results of students who travelled under the academic mobility program, a transfer credit procedure is carried out at department meetings.

The Academy has a Department of External Relations and Academic Mobility, which performs a set of measures to establish external relations and cooperation with foreign partners, as well as coordinate and monitor academic mobility. The Academy has also thought out the issues of financing academic mobility, which is carried out either from the republican budget, or from extra-budgetary funds of KazNAA, or grants from national companies, social partners and international funds, or from personal funds of students.

To organize internships, the university concludes contracts for professional practice with specialized institutions. For instance, one of the bases of practice is A. Kasteyev State Museum of Arts of the Republic of Kazakhstan. In the museum, students are given the opportunity to not only study its exhibits, but also to practice in restoration workshops, be acquainted with the museum's funds and work in its richest library.

The Academy monitors its graduates. Lists of graduates with numbers of issued diplomas are posted on the KazNAA website. Today the Academy has an Alumni Association. The body of student self-government - the "Committee for Youth Affairs", supervises the internal life of students at the Academy.

The Academy pursues a policy of supporting gifted students, exhibiting them in international competitions.

### ***Analytic part***

The analysis of this standard allows us to draw the following conclusions.

1. The Academy demonstrated the policy of forming a contingent of students. This is evidenced by the fact that the current model of the formation of a contingent of students in KazNAA complies with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

2. The leadership of the EP has demonstrated its readiness to conduct special adaptation and support programs for newly admitted students, undergraduates and doctoral students.

3. Members of the EEC note that the process of academic mobility has been established at the university.

### ***Strengths/best practice***

- there is a program to support gifted students;
- an alumni association has been established and is functioning.

### ***EEC recommendation:***

There is no recommendation

### ***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:***

*According to the “Students” standard, 11 criteria are disclosed, of which 2 have a strong position and 9 are satisfactory.*

## **6.8 Standard “Teaching staff”**

*✓ The HEI must have an objective and transparent personnel policy, including recruitment, professional growth and development of personnel, ensuring the professional competence of the entire staff.*

*✓ The HEI must demonstrate the compliance of the staff potential of the teaching staff with the development strategy of the HEI and the specifics of the EP.*

*✓ The HEI must demonstrate awareness of responsibility for its employees and provide them with favourable working environment.*

*✓ The HEI must demonstrate the change in the role of the teacher in connection with the transition to student-centred learning.*

*✓ The HEI should determine the contribution of teaching staff to the implementation of the university development strategy and other strategic documents.*

*✓ The HEI should provide opportunities for career growth and professional development of teaching staff.*

*✓ The HEI should involve practitioners from relevant industries in teaching.*

*✓ The HEI should provide goal-seeking actions for the development of young teachers.*

*✓ The HEI must demonstrate the motivation for the professional and personal development of teachers, including the promotion of both a contribution to the integration of scientific activity and education, and the use of innovative teaching methods.*

*✓ An important factor is the active use of information and communication technologies by the teaching staff in the educational process (for example, on-line training, e-portfolio, MOOC, etc.).*

*✓ An important factor is the development of academic mobility, attracting the best foreign and local teachers.*

*✓ An important factor is the involvement of teaching staff in the life of society (the role of teaching staff in the education system, in the development of science, the region, the creation of a cultural environment, participation in exhibitions, creative competitions, charity programs, etc.).*

### ***Evidence-based part***

In accordance with the personnel policy of KazNAA, approved by the decision of the Academic Council of the Academy of October 28, 2021 (record No. 3), the Academy creates the necessary conditions for the professional development of the faculty and staff. The implementation of this document makes it possible to implement a personnel policy that combines existing approaches, established methods and personnel management tools, taking into account the best experience in the

field of work with personnel.

During the meeting with the teaching staff, the EEC commission could in an interview confirm the main provisions of the university's personnel policy, namely its basic principles: complexity, consistency, validity and efficiency.

The staff of the Academy is a human resource capable of providing competitive advantages and leadership positions. It is the bearer of the corporate culture of the HEI and contributes to the creation of public trust in the activities of the university at different levels. The Academy establishes long-term labour relations with employees based on compliance with the requirements of the Labour Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan, which allow the employee to fully realize the existing level of professional competence, improve in accordance with the needs of the Academy and the requirements of the level of job competence of the employee. Further promotion is carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the competitive replacement of positions of the teaching staff of the RSI "T.K. Zhurgenov Kazakh National Academy" MKS of the RK dated March 26, 2021 (protocol No. 8).

During the announcement of a competition for filling a vacant position of the teaching staff, information is posted on the Academy's Internet resource; for teaching staff, the heads of the personnel documentation and accounting service annually hold a seminar to clarify all the basic qualification requirements, which is in line with the transparency of personnel procedures.

The teaching staff is entrusted with the effectiveness of the educational process, which is ensured by its quality. All teachers have a higher education in the profile of the EP and experience in teaching in the relevant direction. As of January 2023, the total number of teaching staff was 423 people, of which 6 are Doctors of Science, 61 Candidates of Science, 29 PhD Doctors, 10 professors of KKSON, 3 People's Artists, 32 Honoured Artists and Honoured Workers of the Republic of Kazakhstan. 12 people were awarded state awards of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Degree indicators - 40.3%.

The teaching staff sees its role in the implementation of the principle of student-centred learning in the fact that the teacher acts as a teacher-manager, conveying information as a means of activity aimed at the student. At the same time, the personal development of the student acts as the main educational goal.

In order to improve themselves, teachers are forced to review and improve their courses and teaching methods, as they receive constructive feedback from the students involved in the process. The student-centred approach gives the teaching staff the freedom to choose the way of teaching.

Large focus at the Academy is paid to the issues of career growth and professional development of teaching staff. Employees have the opportunity to periodically improve their skills at ATF (Advanced Training Faculty) courses, undergo internships, and participate in research work, conferences, round tables and other events. Particular attention, along with the improvement of pedagogical skills and the development of various teaching methods, is paid to improving the possession of IT-technologies for use in the educational process.

An example is the participation in advanced training courses and trainings "Scientific and methodological foundations for improving the quality of artistic and creative education and achieving sustainable development goals" by the teacher of the Department of Fashion and Costume Design Naimantayeva M.T. in January 2023. Associate Professor of this department Volodya N.A. having completed a number of courses on the educational platform Udemy, she used the acquired skills to improve and update the curricula of the bachelor's degree program Fashion and Costume Design.

Mandatory for teaching staff is the publication on the Web of Science, Scopus platforms. In order to increase the effectiveness of research work, the university conducts trainings and webinars for teaching staff.

The Academy attracts practitioners to the educational process. So, out of 10 teachers of the Department of Fashion and Costume Design, four are practicing designers: Zhumangaliyev M.S., Bekibayeva G.D., Nurmanambetova K.A., Vozzhennikova L.V.

Twice a year, the Academy conducts faculty ratings, according to the results of which it awards outstanding teachers. The Academy successfully implements academic mobility among teaching staff. This academic year, 66 agreements have been signed with international universities on academic mobility. This happens most productively with universities with which partnerships have been

established. As an example, examples of master classes were conducted at the Roma National Academy of Dance by the Academy choreographers – Sushkov D., Zhumagaliev A., Gabbasov G. and Moldakhmetov A.

### ***Analytic part***

1. The Academy has an objective and transparent personnel policy. Experts note that the staff of the teaching staff is staffed in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The management of the Academy is responsible for its employees and for creating favorable working conditions for them. This is evidenced by the provision of the educational and working process with the necessary technical equipment of the new generation, as well as the provision of material remuneration for the teaching staff for active work at the faculties - money reward 2 times a year.

2. Financial assistance is provided in difficult life situations, etc. The EEC notes that it is necessary to strengthen the work on the development of scientific activities and academic mobility of teaching staff and attract the best foreign specialists.

3. The EEC notes that the leadership of the Academy should provide an opportunity and create conditions for attracting foreign scientists to teaching.

4. According to the results of the survey of the teaching staff of the accredited EP, the encouragement of innovation activity of the teaching staff was assessed as very good and good - 95.2%.

### ***Strengths/best practice***

- creating of conditions for attracting practitioners in the field of educational programs to teaching.

### ***EEC recommendation:***

To continue work on the development of academic mobility and attract the best foreign and domestic teaching staff, monitor the effectiveness of academic mobility development programs.

### ***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:***

*According to the standard “Teaching Staff”, 11 criteria are disclosed, of which 1 has a strong position and 10 are satisfactory.*

## **6.9 Standard “Research Work”**

✓ *The HEI must demonstrate the compliance of the priorities of research work with the national policy in the field of education, science and innovative development.*

✓ *The HEI must ensure that the research activities of the mission and strategy of the HEI.*

✓ *The HEI should plan and monitor the effectiveness of research work.*

✓ *The HEI must demonstrate the existence of processes for attracting students to research activities.*

✓ *The HEI must demonstrate assistance in presenting the scientific positions of researchers, teaching staff and students at various scientific platforms, including the publication of scientific results.*

✓ *The HEI should promote the implementation of the results of scientific research, including consulting and commercialization.*

✓ *The HEI should promote the recognition of the results of research work, including the registration of scientific projects with authorized bodies, the issuance of patents and certificate of authorship.*

✓ *The HEI should strive to conduct joint scientific research with foreign universities.*

✓ *The HEI should strive to diversify the forms of funding for research activities.*

✓ *The HEI should stimulate research activities using various forms of motivation.*

### **Evidence-based part**

The research policy of the Academy is organized in accordance with national priorities in the field of education, science and innovation development, its mission and strategy. The HEI conducts semi-annual and quarterly planning of research publishing work.

The plans for research work (R&D) include areas related to increasing the number of writing and publishing articles in the journals RSCI and Committee for Quality Assurance in Science and Higher Education, indexed editions of Web of Science and Scopus; editions in English at CAJAS. In addition, an important policy of the Academy is to increase the number of students participating in national, international student competitions and start'ups.

Plans for R&D and research work of each department have been drawn up and are included in the Development Strategy of the Academy in the period from 2016 to 2026. All R&D is under the focused attention of departments, faculties, and is indicated in the Individual plans of the teaching staff for 20 indicators.

Each teacher uploads his achievements and research results to MOODLE, they are taken into account when determining the rating of the teaching staff. Analysis of the effectiveness of research work of the teaching staff is carefully analysed and approved at a meeting of the Academic Council of the Academy. Pedagogical activity in the field of R&D is rewarded in the appropriate manner.

In the evaluation carried out by R&D, indicators such as the number of international and republican R&D projects published by the teaching staff of the Academy of articles in the Web of Science, Scopus databases, RSCI and CFQASHE journals, publications in the materials of international conferences, patents and copyrights, acts of implementation, etc., as well as scientometric indicators such as the h-index of scientists, the impact factor is a relative indicator of the citation of articles in journals where the teaching staff of the Academy is published.

An important policy of the Academy is to involve students in research work. This is facilitated by the annual republican competition of students' works. Master's students also publish their articles in the materials of international conferences and journals of CFQASHE and RSCI. They are also involved in the Fashion Week Poster Competition. This competition has the status of an international competition. 13 April, 2023, 24 papers were submitted to the III International Online Competition "The Best Poster Report" among undergraduates of creative universities of the CIS, 19 papers passed the selection and reached the final stage. Among the participants were representatives of Kazakh universities of arts, Uzbekistan, Russia, Belarus. The result of the international competition, according to the international jury, was the victory of KazNAA undergraduates: 5 prizes out of 6. The jury introduced a special prize for a participant from Uzbekistan.

Doctoral students of the Academy are published in accordance with the requirements of the State Educational Standard in the journals Scopus and Web of Science.

In 2022, the teaching staff of the Academy received 60 certificates of authorship and patents for scientific works (scientific articles, monographs, etc.). The Academy also cooperates with the organizations of higher postgraduate education in the field of culture and arts, internships are carried out in leading foreign scientific organizations and organizations of higher postgraduate education included in international rankings. Currently, the Academy is implementing joint research with foreign universities. An example is the international research project "Berlin Weltoffenes Fellowship", in which Julia Sorokina is a participant.

In 2022, the Academy took part in four international scientific projects. Among the important publications of this year are more than 11 publications in the journals of the Scopus and Web of Science databases. Below, we list some of them;

№	The article's titles	Department, authors
1	«Architecture of Post-Soviet Kazakhstan: Key Stylistic References in Public Facilities». Civil Engineering and Architecture - Vol. 10. No. 7. 2022. - pp. 31853197.	Department of History and Theory of Fine Arts

	CiteScore - 1. Percentile (Engineering/Architecture) 62; Quartiles Q2. DOI: 10.13189/cea.2022.100730. ISSN 2332-1121.(eng.), <a href="https://www.hrpub.org/journals/article/info.php?aid=12587">https://www.hrpub.org/journals/article/info.php?aid=12587</a>	Truspekova Kh.Kh., Sharipova D.S.
2	«Representation of the Past in the Fine Arts of Kazakhstan through an Appeal to National Folklore (the 1970s-2010s)». Terra Sebus. Acta Musei Sabesiensis. - No 14. CiteScore - 0.4. Percentile (Arts and Humanities/History) 58; Quartiles Q2. 2022. ISSN 20669143, <a href="https://cloud.mail.ru/public/RQ2C/i61pt2VLF">https://cloud.mail.ru/public/RQ2C/i61pt2VLF</a>	Department of History and Theory of Fine Arts Sharipova D.S., Kenzhebaeva L.A.
3	«Religious and traditional aspects of the mythologization of the historical genre in Kazakh national painting: the modern studying principle» Academic Journal of Interdisciplinary Studies E-ISSN: 2281-4612 /ISSN:2281-3993 (certificate of acceptance of the article for publication) <a href="https://edu.kaznai.kz/course/view.php?id=14153">https://edu.kaznai.kz/course/view.php?id=14153</a>	Department of History and theory of fine arts Karabalaeva B.
4	«Research of creativity in the aspect of “socially acceptable” addictions», Journal of Behavioral Addictions, June 20-22, 2022, Nottingham, United Kingdom, Volume 11, Supplement 1, June, 273 стр., <a href="https://drive.google.com/file/d/1kaLZZ8TaY6BAV3VHNdpTtZfF0KxdYFVO/view?usp=sharin">https://drive.google.com/file/d/1kaLZZ8TaY6BAV3VHNdpTtZfF0KxdYFVO/view?usp=sharin</a>	Department of History of Kazakhstan and social sciences Alimzhanova A.Sh.

### ***Analytic part***

1. The Academy supports the priority of research work in the light of compliance with the national policy in education; however, work on the implementation of the results of scientific activity in production is carried out at an insufficient level.
2. The Academy carries out planning and monitoring of the effectiveness of R&D.
3. Particular attention is paid to the involvement of students in research activities along with teaching staff.

### ***Strengths/best practice***

Was not revealed

### ***EEC recommendation***

To promote the implementation of scientific research results, including consulting and commercialization.

### ***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:***

*According to the standard “Research work”, 10 criteria are disclosed, of which 9 have a satisfactory position and 1 suggests improvement.*

## **6.10 Standard “Finance”**

✓ *The HEI should form development scenarios consistent with the development strategy, taking into account the risk assessment.*



- ✓ *The HEI must demonstrate the operational and strategic planning of its budget.*
- ✓ *The HEI must demonstrate the existence of a formalized financial management policy, including financial reporting.*
- ✓ *The HEI must demonstrate the existence of an internal audit system.*
- ✓ *The HEI must demonstrate the conduct of an external independent audit.*
- ✓ *The HEI should have a mechanism for assessing the sufficiency of financial support for various types of university activities, incl. development strategies of the university, development of EP, scientific projects.*

### ***Evidence-based part***

The commission, having studied the documents on the financial statements of the HEI, notes that the Academy today is a financially stable enterprise. Financial activities are implemented based on the legislative acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan, regulated by internal university documents. The implementation of strategic plans is generally carried out based on the effective use of our own material, financial and human resources. When planning revenues for the maintenance of the academy, the amount of funding for the implementation of the state educational order for the training of specialists with higher and postgraduate education, carried out from the republican budget, is taken into account. The income of the Academy is characterized by stability (Table 10.1).

Table 10.1 *Sources and amounts of funding for the educational process (thousand tenge)*

Indicators	2019	2020	2021	2022
Republican budget	2,647,269,8	2 810 080,0	2 965 440,0	4 432 161,0
including				
041 programme sub-programme 100	2 647 269,8	2 794 664,0	2 914 985,0	4 432 161,0
041 programme sub-programme 104		15 416,0	50 455,0	0,0
Chargeable services	548 437,9	665 738,2	517 989,6	708 968 ,6
Total funding	3 195 707,7	3 475 818,2	3 483 429,6	5 141 129,6
Share in % ratio, including:	100	100	100	100
Republican budget	79,3	76,4	82,6	84,1
Chargeable services	20,7	23,6	17,4	15,9

The volume of financing of the educational process from the republican budget is 80.8-86.2%, due to the provision of paid services - 13.8-19.2%.

In the structure of expenses of an educational institution, the main share is occupied by wages, its dynamics remains consistently high, and this indicates the fulfilment of the management's intentions to improve the material and social well-being of its employees (Table 10.2).

Table 10.2 *Amounts of financing of the main items of expenditure (thousand tenge)*

Indicators	2019	2020	2021	2022
<b>Budget</b>				
Remuneration of labour	1,583,181,4	1,703,434,6	1,760,949,4	2,768,638,2
Purchasing food	38,524,0	7,032,5	27,553,3	54,630,0

Purchase of other inventories	24,404,8	30,487,8	33,789,0	38,232,8
Payment of utility services	36,501,0	46,325,8	51,530,0	71,006,0
Payment for other services and works	93,726,8	102,259,3	49,436,2	42,469,0
Business trips and foreign business trips	19,402,0		546,5	2,422,7
Other operating costs	76,954,7	34,819,7	52,623,0	43,044,3
Transfers to individuals	11,301,0	15,388,0	11,601,0	10,350,0
Scholarship	406,105,5	522,812,6	533,686,0	592,612,0
<b>Chargeable services</b>				
Remuneration of labour	181 412,7	194 237,9	239 711,5	297 169,6
Purchase of other inventories	2 222,6	18 207,0	20 185,3	29 886,1
Payment of utility services	4 149,9	2 214,8	5 120,2	20 581,5
Payment for other services and works	72 769 ,6	70 641,6	170 925,7	176 404,1
Business trips and foreign business trips	8 088,2	93,7	1 342,8	4 364,2
Other operating costs	15 967,9	6 998,6	10 826,2	34 579,1
Scholarship		3 050.0	3 336,1	4 410,2
Purchase of machinery, equipment, tools, production inventory	63 912,9	20 263,9	13 067,7	77 075,1

A long-term plan for financing the Academy is formed in accordance with the mission, goals and objectives of the strategic development of the Academy. The financial strategy of the Academy includes ensuring financial stability, cost optimization, improving the well-being of employees. The effectiveness of planning the activities of the Academy is achieved by analysing the activities of the main directions. The financing plan is drawn up for 3 years, for the coming year it is specified taking into account changes in the MCI, BDO, MWL (minimum wage level).

The financial statements of the Academy are carried out according to IFRS; semi-annual and annual financial statements are submitted to the Ministry of Culture and Sports of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The Accounts Committee of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Internal Audit Department of the Ministry of Culture and Sports of the Republic of Kazakhstan carry out the external audit of the financial and economic activities of the Academy. The Accounts Committee in 2019 carried out the last audit by the Internal Audit Department in 2021.

The Academy is updating, modernizing, and equipping the material and technical base of the academy. The acquisition of funds necessary for the educational process is carried out based on applications and consideration of their relevance at the administration.

Issues of evaluating the effectiveness of the use of financial resources are discussed systematically at meetings of the administration, the Academic Council.

Thus, the analysis of financial activity shows that the Academy is a financially reliable organization.

### ***Analytic part***

Experts note the existence of a mechanism for assessing the sufficiency of financial support for various types of the Academy activities, there is a dynamic development of the Academy, which is characterized by stability and financial stability. The Academy is taking measures to provide financial incentives for the teaching staff and employees, allocating funds for updating and expanding the material base of the Academy. *At the same time, the Academy does not assess the risks of financial activity, has not developed an internal audit system, and does not document financial management, including monitoring and reporting.*

## **Strengths**

Was not revealed

## **Weakness**

The Academy does not conduct a risk assessment; therefore, no measures are taken to develop alternative development scenarios.

## **EEC recommendation:**

To take measures to assess financial risks and develop alternative development scenarios.

To develop a documented financial management procedure, including monitoring and reporting (until 2024).

To assess the effectiveness of the functioning of the internal audit mechanism (until the end of 2023).

## **Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:**

*According to the "Finance" standard, 6 criteria are disclosed, of which 6 have a satisfactory position.*

### **6.11. Standard "Educational resources and student support systems"**

*✓ The HEI must guarantee the compliance of educational resources, including material and technical, and infrastructure with the goals of the educational program.*

*✓ The management of the EP must demonstrate the availability of classrooms, laboratories and other facilities equipped with modern equipment and ensuring the achievement of the objectives of the EP.*

*✓ The HEI must demonstrate the compliance of information resources with the needs of the university and the implemented EP, including in the following areas:*

*✓ technological support for students and teaching staff in accordance with educational programs (for example, online learning, modelling, databases, data analysis programs);*

*✓ library resources, including a fund of educational, methodical and scientific literature on general educational, basic and major disciplines on paper and electronic media, periodicals, access to scientific databases;*

*✓ examination of the results of research, final works, dissertations for plagiarism;*

*✓ access to educational Internet resources;*

*✓ WI-FI functioning on the territory.*

*✓ The HEI must demonstrate that it creates conditions for conducting scientific research, integrating science and education, publishing the results of research work of teaching staff, staff and students.*

*✓ The HEI should strive to ensure that the educational equipment and software used for the development of educational programs are similar to those used in the relevant sectors of the economy.*

*✓ The management of the EP must demonstrate the existence of procedures for supporting various groups of students, including information and counselling.*

*✓ The management of the EP should show the existence of conditions for the advancement of the student along an individual educational trajectory.*

*✓ The HEI must take into account the needs of different groups of students (adults, working, foreign students, as well as students with special educational needs).*

*✓ The HEI must ensure that the infrastructure meets the safety requirements.*

## **Evidence-based part**

The quality of education in KazNAA is determined, among other things, by educational resources. The Academy provides a sufficient number of educational resources, thought out student support service.

The learning environment for students, undergraduates, doctoral students includes material, technical and information resources that meet the requirements established for the main activity and contribute to the formation of students' professional competence.

Residential buildings of the hostel include 282 beds for studying students of the Academy. There are also offices for administration and service personnel.

In the I educational building there are 2 medical blocks (with an area of 16 sq.m, an office for receiving patients), in the II educational building there is a medical block with an area of 125.3 m<sup>2</sup>, which complies with SanPiN (Sanitary Regulations and Standards) dated 08/16/2017 No. 611 with an application dated 08/28/2020. No.KR DSM-98/2020 "Sanitary and epidemiological requirements for educational objects". Permission for medical activities is confirmed by a state license (series LP No. 00085 dated 05/06/2009, issued by the Committee for Control over the provision of medical services of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, with Appendix No.1 to the state license for medical and medical activities, for the provision of primary health care assistance (qualified)).

There is a paediatrician's office, a treatment room, 2 isolation wards for 4 beds, and a medical records room. According to Appendix 10 to SanPiN, there are medical equipment and tools for equipping a medical office. The equipment of medical offices meets the sanitary and epidemiological requirements for medical support at educational facilities.

The complex of buildings of the Academy provides everything necessary to create a barrier-free environment - there are ramps, the floors are equipped with special markings (for the visually impaired).

The infrastructure existing in the Academy, its material and technical resources fully comply with the requirements of regulatory legal acts in the field of education, including the Qualification requirements for educational activities).

Having set the task of creating a modern creative, educational and laboratory base, developing multimedia and distance learning technologies; development of social infrastructure; digitalization and informatization of education and scientific research, development of Internet resources, the Academy provides itself with a base for educational and scientific activities.

The visit KazNAA demonstrated the availability of halls for videoconferencing, recording video lectures, equipping classrooms and laboratories with modern equipment and computers with Internet connection, equipping classrooms with modern educational facilities (projectors, interactive whiteboards, scanners, printers, audio and video equipment, multimedia facilities), equipment of workshops, etc.

The material and technical base of the Academy includes modern classrooms equipped with multimedia projectors, computers and equipment: furnaces, potter's wheels, looms, rollers, burners, polishers, sewing machines, film studios, a recording studio, an educational theatre, a cinema hall, etc.

In addition, the classrooms of the departments are equipped with stands and visual teaching aids. In each workshop, there are work plans, passports, instructions, a safety magazine, a memo and instructions on fire safety measures. Each workshop is equipped with fire extinguishers: fire extinguishers, sandboxes. All classrooms and workshops are themed.

An example, the Department of Decorative Arts, where there are workshops for painting and composition, drawing workshops, workshops for artistic processing of wood, workshops for artistic processing of textiles, workshops for artistic processing of metal, a sculpture workshop, a ceramic workshop with a firing kiln, computer classes with specialized licensed programs, the KazNAA museum (where exhibitions of creative works of teaching staff and students are held), canteens, etc.

The arsenal of the Department of Fashion and Costume Design includes a computer class and a sewing workshop equipped with modern industrial sewing and embroidery machines, over lockers, loop overcasting machines, cutting tables, equipment for wet-heat treatment and specialized operations for working with metal fittings.

The Academy provides full support to students, providing them with information, reference and methodological materials necessary for mastering the EP: guidebooks, ED catalogues,

syllabuses, guidelines for writing written works, master's theses and projects. The content of information and reference and methodological materials meet the requirements of the EP, is determined by the teaching staff and considered at a meeting of the departments.

Information, reference and methodological materials are available in the public domain, posted on the website of the academy, available to users in the required languages. The website of the academy is focused on applicants, students, business partners of the academy, and contains all the information reflecting the activities, achievements and development prospects of KazNAA.

Students receive information about the possibilities of forming an individual educational trajectory at meetings with heads of departments and have the opportunity to form it in the AIS "Platonus".

In order to control the independence of students and teaching staff in writing papers, research and dissertations, the Academy uses the open access system "AntiPlagiarism" (<http://www.strikeplagiarism.com>) allowing to identify the degree of borrowing information. The vice-rector for research work carries out the general management of the work on organizing the verification of the independence of the performance of written work by students and teaching staff at the Academy. Coordination of the activities of scientific supervisors in checking written works, final qualifying works and scientific articles is carried out and controlled by the head of the department.

If the student or teaching staff, expressed in writing, disagrees with the results of the plagiarism check, an appeal commission is created, chaired by the vice-rector for research work. The absence of a statement of disagreement with the results of the plagiarism check means the recognition of the results of the check. The dean's office of the faculty, upon the presentation of the department on the discovery of the fact of plagiarism, establishes a type of disciplinary sanction in relation to the student.

Regulations on checking for plagiarism the written works of students and faculty of the T.K. Zhurgenov Kazakh National Academy of Arts approved and put into effect by Protocol No.3 of the Academic Council of the RSI "T.K. Zhurgenov Kazakh National Academy of Arts" MCS RK dated October 31, 2019, establishes the minimum requirements for the originality of the text for admission to protection and publication.

The Academy has an extensive communication fibre-optic network that connects server "nodes" and unites all buildings into a single corporate network using modern communication equipment and IP/VPN technology. Servers located in various educational buildings provide teachers, staff and students with access to the information and communication infrastructure of the Academy.

High-speed Internet connection, consistent with the indicator of the development strategy of the Academy. The use of new technologies ensured regular interactive presentations, participation in online seminars and video conferences. Through Wi-Fi technology, access to the global network was provided almost throughout the main building of the Academy.

The Academy has a periodical international scientific publication - the Central Asian Journal of Art Studies, which is a collection of scientific articles, including the teaching staff of the Academy.

### *Analytic part*

As a result of a visual online inspection by members of the EEC of the facilities of the material base and acquaintance with the material base during the interview with the rector and heads of departments, the following was noted:

1. The management of the accredited EP has demonstrated the sufficiency of material and technical resources and infrastructure. This is evidenced by the fact that the buildings and structures of the academy comply with the current sanitary standards and fire safety requirements, classroom and laboratory facilities, classrooms and other premises, sports facilities comply with the established standards and rules.

2. Experts note that undergraduates have access to educational Internet resources that correspond

to the specifics of the EP; however, there is a lack of electronic textbooks.

3. Questioning of students, conducted during the visit of the EEC IAAR, and showed that full and partial satisfaction with the existing scientific laboratories 72.8%; computer classes 81.9%; the quality of medical care at the university 81.8%; the quality of services provided in libraries and reading rooms is 95.5%.

#### ***Strengths/best practice***

– availability of support procedures for various groups of students, including information and counselling;

- educational equipment and software used to master the EP were similar to those used in the respective industries

#### ***EEC recommendation***

To replenish the library with electronic educational literature according to the profile.

***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria: strong 2; satisfactory 10; suggest improvements 0; unsatisfactory -0***

### **6.12 Standard “Public information”**

✓ *The information published by the HEI must be accurate, objective, up-to-date and must include:*

- *implemented programs, indicating the expected learning outcomes;*

- *information on the possibility of awarding qualifications at the end of the EP;*

- *information about teaching, learning, assessment procedures;*

- *information about passing scores and learning opportunities provided to students;*

- *information about employment opportunities for graduates.*

✓ *The management of the HEI should use a variety of ways to disseminate information (including the media, web resources, information networks, etc.) to inform the general public and interested parties.*

✓ *Informing the public should include support and explanation of the national development programs of the country and the system of higher and postgraduate education.*

✓ *The HEI must publish audited financial statements on its own web resource.*

✓ *The HEI must demonstrate the reflection on the web resource of information characterizing the HEI as a whole and in the context of the EP.*

✓ *An important factor is the availability of adequate and objective information about the teaching staff, in the context of personalities.*

✓ *An important factor is the placement of information about cooperation and interaction with partners, including scientific / consulting organizations, business partners, social partners and educational organizations.*

✓ *The HEI should post information and links to external resources based on the results of external evaluation procedures.*

#### ***Evidence-based part***

During the visit, EEC experts studied materials and documents, as well as information posted on the official website of the Academy <https://kaznai.kz/>, publications of accounts in social networks and the media. The website of the university contains adequate and objective information about the teaching staff of the EP, in the context of personalities, information on cooperation and interaction with partners.

The information policy of the university is aimed at ensuring a stable information flow of news about significant events and achievements; attracting the interest of potential consumers to new programs and developments of scientists of the Academy.

Detailed information about the process of teaching, learning and assessment procedures is reflected in the Academic Policy.

There is a Rector's blog operates on the official website, where you can ask a question and get an answer to it.

The Academy uses various information channels for its promotion and positioning, for example, through social networks: Instagram, Facebook, Youtube.

The teachers of the Academy have an online portfolio on electronic platforms, in particular, associate professor Zhumagalieva M.S. (Instagram @arlanzhete), Associate Professor Volodya N.A. (@nataliavolodeva and @nataliavolodeva\_art), creative works of associate professor Bekibayeva G.D. presented on the page of the “Manera” clothing brand @manera.official and the website <http://manera.kz>.

Information about educational programs is also distributed through propaganda literature (booklets, triplets, videos, interviews) during the period of the admission campaign. Links to publications, articles about the university, achievements, and Academy events in various electronic and printed publications of the republican and regional scale are posted on the site. According to statistics, the Academy is one of the active users of RMEB <http://rmebrk.kz/>. Public information channels are Internet portals, printed newspapers, magazines, advertising booklets, social pages, information stands. There is an electronic document management system.

#### ***Analytic part***

During the analysis of the documents and the content of the site, the experts found that the university uses a variety of ways to disseminate information: the media, web resources, social networks, etc. The available information is up-to-date; the news feed contains materials of recent events. Information about the main activities of the Academy is mainly presented.

At the same time, EEC experts point out *that the site does not reflect information on cooperation and interaction with scientific / consulting organizations, business partners, etc.* Also, experts note that audited financial statements are not posted on the Academy website.

The Commission recommends in the future informing the public about the movement of funds for the main activities of the academy, which will undoubtedly increase the level of confidence in the organization on the part of stakeholders.

#### ***Strengths/best practice***

Was not revealed

#### ***EEC recommendation***

- to reflect information about interaction with scientific organizations, consulting organizations, business partners, etc.

- to practice publishing the results of the Academy's activities and audited financial statements on the website of the Academy to inform the general public.

#### ***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:***

***According to the standard “Public information”, 8 criteria are disclosed, of which 8 have a satisfactory position.***

## **(VII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICE FOR EACH STANDARD**

### **Standard “Strategic development and quality assurance”**

Was not revealed

### **Standard “Leadership and management”**

Participation in international, national and regional professional alliances, associations, etc.

### **Standard “Information management and reporting”**

Was not revealed

### **Standard “Development and approval of educational programs”**

The HEI determines the influence of disciplines and professional practices on the formation of learning outcomes.

### **Standard “Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of the educational programs”**

Was not revealed.

### **Standard “Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment”**

The use of various forms and methods of teaching in teaching.

Availability of feedback on the use of various teaching methods and evaluation of learning outcomes.

Availability of own research in the field of teaching methods of academic disciplines.

Demonstrate support for learner autonomy while providing guidance and assistance from the teacher.

### **Standard “Students”**

There is a support program for gifted students.

Alumni association established and functioning

### **Standard “Teaching staff”**

Creation of conditions for attracting practitioners of the relevant industry to teaching.

### **Standard “Research work”**

Was not revealed.

### **Standard “Finance”**

Was not revealed.

### **Standard “Educational resources and student support systems”**

Availability of support procedures for various groups of students, including information and counselling.

The educational equipment and software used to master the EP were similar to those used in the respective industries.

### **Standard “Public information”**

Was not revealed.



## **(VIII) OVERVIEW RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVING QUALITY FOR EACH STANDARD**

### **Standard “Strategic development and quality assurance”**

To organize by 2024 the process of analysing the identified possible risks with the identification of specific measures to prevent or minimize each of them.

### **Standard “Leadership and management”**

To ensure the analysis of innovations for the last academic year on all topics being introduced;

To develop a mechanism for corrective and preventive actions in order to eliminate deficiencies identified as part of the process of measuring the degree of satisfaction with the needs of teaching staff, staff and students, as well as within the framework of internal audits (until 2024);

To develop a plan for the management of the Academy, structural divisions and EP to undergo training in education management programs (until the end of 2023).

### **Standard “Information management and reporting”**

To develop and implement a clear mechanism for informing all stakeholders about the decisions taken by the Academy management based on the results of the analysis of feedback data (until 2024).

To determine the persons responsible for the reliability and timeliness of the analysis of information and the provision of data, assessing the effectiveness and efficiency of the EP, ensuring the protection of information and (until the end of 2023).

### **Standard “Development and approval of educational programs”**

To supplement the content of the EP with research elements (until the end of 2024).

The leadership of the EP to start purposeful work on organizing the preparation of students for professional certification.

### **Standard “Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of the educational programs”**

Develop a procedure for monitoring employers' satisfaction with the quality of graduate training (until 2024).

Promptly inform employers, students and other interested parties about changes in the EP.

### **Standard “Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment”**

There is no recommendation

### **Standard “Students”**

There is no recommendation

### **Standard “Teaching staff”**

To continue work on the development of academic mobility and attract the best foreign and domestic teaching staff, monitor the effectiveness of academic mobility development programs.

### **Standard “Research work”**

To promote the implementation of scientific research results, including consulting and commercialization.

### **Standard “Finance”**

To take measures to assess financial risks and develop alternative development scenarios.

To develop a documented financial management procedure, including monitoring and reporting (until 2024).

To assess the effectiveness of the functioning of the internal audit mechanism (until the end of 2023).

**Standard “Educational resources and student support systems”**

To replenish the library with electronic educational literature according to the profile.

**Standard “Public information”**

To reflect information on interaction with scientific organizations, consulting organizations, business partners, etc.

### **(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION BOARD**

The external expert commission made a unanimous decision to recommend to the IAAR Accreditation Council that RSI “Temirbek Zhurgenov Kazakh National Academy of Arts” MKS RK to accredit the for a period of 5 (five) years.

**Appendix 1. ASSESSMENT TABLE “PARAMETERS OF INSTITUTIONAL PROFILE”**

**Conclusion of the external expert commission for quality assessment of the RSI “Temirbek Zhurgenov Kazakh National Academy of Arts” MKS RK**

№ п\п	№ п\п	Assessment criteria	Position of the educational organization			
			Strong	Satisfactory	Involves improving	Unsatisfactory
<b>Standard “Strategic development and quality assurance”</b>						
1	1.	The HEI must demonstrate the development of a unique mission, vision and strategy based on the analysis of external and internal factors with the wide involvement of a variety of stakeholders		+		
2	2.	The HEI must demonstrate the orientation of the mission, vision and strategy to meet the needs of the state, society, sectors of the real economy, potential employers, students and other stakeholders		+		
3	3.	The HEI must demonstrate the transparency of the processes of formation, monitoring and regular review of the mission, vision, strategy and quality assurance policy		+		
4	4.	The HEI must have a published quality assurance policy, mission, vision and strategy		+		
5	5.	The HEI develops documents on certain areas of activity and processes (plans, programs, regulations, etc.), specifying the quality assurance policy		+		
6	6.	The quality assurance policy should reflect the relationship between research, teaching and learning		+		
7	7.	The HEI must demonstrate the development of a culture of quality assurance		+		
<b>Total on the standard</b>			0	7	0	0
<b>Standard “Leadership and management”</b>						
8	1.	The HEI carries out management processes, including planning and allocation of resources in accordance with the strategy.		+		

9	2.	The HEI must demonstrate the successful operation and improvement of the internal quality assurance system		+		
10	3.	HEI must demonstrate risk management analysis		+		
11	4.	The HEI must demonstrate the analysis of the effectiveness of changes		+		
12	5.	The HEI must demonstrate the analysis of identified non-conformities, the implementation of the developed corrective and preventive actions			+	
13	6.	The HEI must demonstrate the provision of educational process management through the management of educational programs, including the evaluation of their effectiveness			+	
14	7.	The HEI demonstrates the development of annual action plans, including teaching staff, based on the Strategy		+		
15	8.	Commitment to quality assurance should apply to any activity performed by contractors and partners (outsourcing), including the implementation of joint/double-degree education and academic mobility		+		
16	9.	The HEI must provide evidence of the transparency of the HEI management system.		+		
17	10.	The HEI must ensure the participation of students and teaching staff in the work of collegial governing bodies		+		
18	11.	The HEI must demonstrate evidence of openness and accessibility of managers and administration for students, teaching staff, parents and other stakeholders		+		
19	12.	The HEI must demonstrate innovation management, including the analysis and implementation of innovative proposals			+	
20	13.	The HEI should strive to participate in international, national and regional professional alliances, associations, etc.	+			
21	14.	The HEI must provide training for the management of the HEI, structural divisions and educational programs on education management programs.		+		
22	15.	The HEI should strive to ensure that the progress made since the last external quality assurance procedure is taken into account when preparing for the next procedure.		+		
<b>Total on the standard</b>			<b>1</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Standard “Information management and reporting”</b>						

23	1.	The HEI must ensure the functioning of the system for collecting, analysing and managing information based on the use of modern information and communication technologies and software.		+		
24	2.	The HEI must demonstrate the use of processed, adequate information for the effective management of educational programs, improving the internal quality assurance system.		+		
25	3.	The HEI should have a system of regular reporting at all levels of the organizational structure, including an assessment of the effectiveness and efficiency of the activities of departments, study programs, scientific research and their interaction.		+		
26	4.	The HEI must establish the frequency, forms and methods for assessing the management of the EP, the activities of collegial bodies and structural divisions, top management, and the implementation of scientific projects.		+		
27	5.	The HEI must demonstrate the determination of the procedure and ensuring the protection of information, including the identification of persons responsible for the reliability and timeliness of the analysis of information and the provision of data.		+		
28	6.	An important factor is the involvement of students, employees and teaching staff in the processes of collecting and analyzing information, as well as making decisions based on them.		+		
29	7.	The HEI must demonstrate the existence of a mechanism for communication with students, employees and other stakeholders, including the existence of mechanisms for resolving conflicts.		+		
30	8.	The HEI must ensure the measurement of the degree of satisfaction with the needs of teaching staff, staff and students and demonstrate evidence of the elimination of identified shortcomings.		+		
31	9.	The HEI should evaluate the effectiveness and efficiency of its activities, including in the context of EP			+	
		The information collected and analysed by the HEI should take into account:		+		
32	10.	key performance indicators		+		
33	11.	the dynamics of the contingent of students in the context of forms and types		+		
34	12.	academic performance, student achievement and dropout		+		
35	13.	satisfaction of students with the implementation of the EP and the quality of education at the HEI		+		

36	14.	availability of educational resources and support systems for students		+		
37	15.	employment and career growth of graduates		+		
38	16.	Students, teaching staff and other internal stakeholders must document their consent to the processing of personal data		+		
38	17.	The HEI should contribute to providing all the necessary information in the relevant fields of science.		+		
<b>Total on the standard</b>			0	16	1	0
<b>Standard “Development and approval of educational programs”</b>						
39	1.	The HEI must demonstrate the existence of a documented procedure for the development and approval of the educational program at the institutional level.		+		
40	2.	The HEI must demonstrate the compliance of the developed EP with the established goals, including the expected learning outcomes.		+		
41	3.	The HEI must demonstrate the existence of a developed model of the EP graduate, which describes the learning outcomes and personal qualities.		+		
42	4.	The HEI must demonstrate the conduct of external expertise of the EP		+		
43	5.	The qualification awarded upon completion of the EP must be clearly defined, explained and correspond to a certain level of NQF, QF-EHEA		+		
44	6.	The HEI should determine the influence of disciplines and professional practices on the formation of learning outcomes	+			
45	7.	An important factor is the possibility of preparing students for professional certification		+		
46	8.	The HEI must provide evidence of the participation of students, teaching staff and other stakeholders in the development of the EP, ensuring their quality		+		
47	9.	The HEI must ensure that the content of academic disciplines and learning outcomes correspond to the level of education (bachelor's, master's, doctoral studies)		+		
48	10.	The structure of the EP should provide for various types of activities corresponding to the learning outcomes		+		
49	11.	An important factor is the presence of joint EPs with foreign educational organizations		+		
<b>Total on the standard</b>			1	10	0	0

<b>Standard “Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of the educational programs”</b>						
50	1.	The HEI must demonstrate the existence of a documented procedure for monitoring and periodically evaluating the EP in order to achieve the goal of the EP. The results of these procedures are aimed at continuous improvement of the EP.		+		
51	2.	The HEI must ensure the revision of the content and structure of the EP, taking into account changes in the labor market, the requirements of employers and the social demand of society		+		
		Monitoring and periodic evaluation of the EP should consider:		+		
52	3.	the content of the programs in the light of the latest achievements of science in a particular discipline to ensure the relevance of the discipline taught		+		
53	4.	changing needs of society and the professional environment		+		
54	5.	workload, performance and graduation of students		+		
55	6.	effectiveness of student assessment procedures		+		
56	7.	expectations, needs and satisfaction of students with EP training		+		
57	8.	educational environment and support services, their compliance with the objectives of the EP		+		
58	9.	The HEI must provide evidence of the participation of students, employers and other stakeholders in the revision of the EP		+		
59	10.	All stakeholders must be informed of any planned or undertaken actions in relation to the EP. All changes made to the OP must be published		+		
60	11.	Support services should ensure that the needs of different groups of learners are identified and met.		+		
<b>Total on the standard</b>			0	11	0	0
<b>Standard “Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment”</b>						
61	1.	The HEI must ensure respect and attention to various groups of students and their needs, providing them with flexible learning paths		+		
62	2.	The HEI must ensure the use of various forms and methods of teaching and learning	+			
63	3.	The HEI must demonstrate the presence of a feedback system on the use of various teaching methods and the assessment of learning outcomes	+			



64	4.	An important factor is the presence of own research in the field of teaching methods of academic disciplines	+			
65	5.	The HEI must demonstrate support for student autonomy while providing guidance and assistance from the teacher	+			
66	6.	The HEI must demonstrate the existence of a procedure for responding to complaints from students		+		
67	7.	The HEI must ensure the consistency, transparency and objectivity of the mechanism for assessing learning outcomes, including an appeal		+		
68	8.	The HEI must ensure that the procedures for assessing the learning outcomes of students correspond to the planned learning outcomes and program goals. Criteria and evaluation methods should be published in advance.		+		
69	9.	The HEI should determine the mechanisms for ensuring the development of learning outcomes by each graduate and ensure the completeness of their formation.		+		
70	10.	Assessors must be familiar with modern methods for assessing learning outcomes and regularly improve their skills in this area.		+		
<b>Total on the standard</b>			4	6	0	0
<b>Standard “Students”</b>						
71	1.	The HEI must demonstrate the policy of forming a contingent of students from admission to graduation and ensure the transparency of its procedures. The procedures governing the life cycle of students (from admission to completion) must be defined, approved, published		+		
72	2.	The HEI should provide for special adaptation and support programs for newly enrolled and foreign students		+		
73	3.	The HEI must demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, including the existence and application of a mechanism for recognizing the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of additional, formal and non-formal education		+		
74	4.	The HEI should cooperate with other educational organizations and national centres of the “European Network of National Information Centres for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information Centres” ENIC / NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications		+		

75	5.	The HEI should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of students, as well as assist them in obtaining external grants for education		+		
76	6.	The HEI should make every effort to provide students with internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and maintain contact with them.		+		
77	7.	The HEI must provide graduates with documents confirming the qualifications received, including the achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion.		+		
78	8.	The HEI must demonstrate the existence of a mechanism for monitoring the employment and professional activities of graduates		+		
79	9.	The HEI should actively encourage students to self-education and development outside the main program (extracurricular activities)		+		
80	10.	An important factor is the existence of an active alumni association/union	+			
81	11.	An important factor is the existence of a mechanism to support gifted students.	+			
<b>Total on the standard</b>			2	9	0	0
<b>Standard "Teaching staff"</b>						
82	1.	The HEI must have an objective and transparent personnel policy, including recruitment, professional growth and development of personnel, ensuring the professional competence of the entire staff		+		
83	2.	The HEI must have clear, transparent and objective criteria for hiring employees, appointments, promotions, dismissals and follow them in its activities		+		
84	3.	The HEI must demonstrate the compliance of the staff potential of the teaching staff with the development strategy of the university and the specifics of the EP		+		
85	4.	The HEI must demonstrate the change in the role of the teacher in connection with the transition to student-centered learning		+		
86	5.	The HEI must determine the contribution of teaching staff to the implementation of the development strategy of the university and other strategic documents		+		
87	6.	The HEI should provide opportunities for career growth and professional development of teaching staff, including young		+		

89	7.	The HEI should involve practitioners from relevant industries in teaching	+			
90	8.	The HEI must demonstrate the motivation for the professional and personal development of teachers, including the promotion of both a contribution to the integration of scientific activity and education, and the use of innovative teaching methods		+		
91	9.	An important factor is the active use of information and communication technologies by teaching staff in the educational process (for example, on-line training, e-portfolio, MOOCs, etc.)		+		
92	10.	The HEI must demonstrate the focus on the development of academic mobility, attracting the best foreign and domestic teachers.		+		
93	11.	The HEI can show the involvement of teaching staff in the life of society (the role of teaching staff in the education system, in the development of science, the region, the creation of a cultural environment, participation in exhibitions, creative competitions, charity programs, etc.)		+		
<b>Total on the standard</b>			1	10	0	0
<b>Standard “Research work”</b>						
94	1.	The HEI must demonstrate the compliance of the priorities of research work with the national policy in the field of education, science and innovative development		+		
95	2.	The HEI must ensure that the research activities of the mission and strategy of the HEI		+		
96	3.	The HEI should plan and monitor the effectiveness of R&D		+		
97	4.	The HEI must demonstrate the existence of processes for attracting students to research activities		+		
98	5.	The HEI must demonstrate assistance in presenting the scientific positions of researchers, teaching staff and students at various scientific platforms, including the publication of scientific results		+		
99	6.	The HEI should promote the implementation of the results of scientific research, including consulting and commercialization			+	
100	7.	The HEI should promote the recognition of the results of research work, including the registration of scientific projects with authorized bodies, the registration of patents and certificates of authorship		+		

101	8.	An important factor is the conduct of joint scientific research with foreign universities		+		
102	9.	The HEI should strive to diversify the sources of funding for research activities		+		
103	10.	The HEI should provide mechanisms for motivating the research activities of students, teaching staff and other internal stakeholders		+		
<b>Total on the standard</b>			0	9	1	0
<b>Standard “Finance”</b>						
104	1.	The HEI must form development scenarios consistent with the development strategy, taking into account risk assessment		+		
105	2.	The HEI must demonstrate operational and strategic planning of its budget		+		
106	3.	The HEI must demonstrate the existence of a formalized financial management policy, including financial reporting		+		
107	4.	The HEI must demonstrate the existence of an internal audit system		+		
108	5.	The HEI must demonstrate the conduct of an external independent audit		+		
109	6.	The HEI should have a mechanism for assessing the sufficiency of financial support for various types of HEI activities, incl. development strategies of the HEI, development of EP, scientific projects		+		
<b>Total on the standard</b>			0	6	0	0
<b>Standard “Educational resources and student support systems”</b>						
110	1.	The HEI must ensure that educational resources, including material and technical, and infrastructure correspond to the strategic goals of the HEI		+		
111	2.	The HEI must demonstrate the existence of procedures for supporting various groups of students, including information and counseling	+	+		
		The HEI must demonstrate the compliance of information resources with strategic goals:		+		
112	3.	technological support for students and teaching staff in accordance with educational programs (for example, online learning, modeling, databases, data analysis programs)		+		
113	4.	library resources, including a fund of educational, methodical and scientific literature on general education,		+		

		basic and major disciplines on paper and electronic media, periodicals, access to scientific databases				
114	5.	examination of the results of research, final works, dissertations for plagiarism		+		
115	6.	access to educational Internet resources		+		
116	7.	functioning of WI-FI in its territory		+		
117	8.	The HEI should strive to create conditions for educational, scientific and other activities. Students, teachers, employees and other stakeholders, should carry out appropriate development of the infrastructure based on the results of monitoring the satisfaction with the infrastructure.		+		
118	9.	The HEI should strive to ensure that the educational equipment and software used to master the EP are similar to those used in the relevant industries	+			
119	10.	The HEI must ensure that the infrastructure meets the safety requirements		+		
120	11.	The HEI must take into account the needs of different groups of students (adults, working, foreign students, as well as students with disabilities)		+		
121	12.	The HEI creates conditions for the advancement of the student along an individual educational trajectory		+		
<b>Total on the standard</b>			2	10	0	0
<b>Standard “Public information”</b>						
122	1.	The information published by the HEI must be accurate, objective, up-to-date and reflect all areas of the HEI's activities.		+		
123	2.	The HEI management should use a variety of ways to disseminate information (including the media, web resources, information networks, etc.) to inform the general public and interested parties.		+		
124	3.	Informing the public should include support and explanation of the national development programs of the country and the system of higher and postgraduate education		+		
125	4.	The HEI must publish audited financial statements on its own web resource		+		
126	5.	The HEI must demonstrate the reflection on the web resource of information characterizing the university as a whole and in the context of the EP.		+		

127	6.	An important factor is the availability of adequate and objective information about the teaching staff, in the context of personalities		+		
1328	7.	An important factor is informing the public about cooperation and interaction with partners, including scientific / consulting organizations, business partners, social partners and educational organizations.		+		
129	8.	The HEI must publish information and links to external resources based on the results of external evaluation procedures		+		
<b>Total on the standard</b>			0	8	0	0
<b>TOTAL</b>			<b>11</b>	<b>113</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>0</b>

11 ( 8,5 %) the parameters have the position “strong”

113 (87, 5%) parameters have the position “satisfactory”

5 (4%) parameters have the position “involves improving”