

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR ACCREDITATION AND RATING

External expert commission

*Addressed to
Accreditation
Council of the IAAR*



REPORT

**on the results of the work of the external expert commission for the evaluation
for compliance with the requirements of the standards of primary specialized accreditation
of educational programs (Ex-ante)**

**8D02102 PAINTING, 8D02108 APPLIED ARTS
RGO "T.K.ZHURGENOV KAZAKH NATIONAL ACADEMY
OF ARTS" MCS RK**

Date of EEC visit: from May 31 to June 02, 2022

Almaty "02" June 2022

Content

(I) LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS	3
(II) INTRODUCTION.....	4
(III) REPRESENTATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION	6
(IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE 7	
(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC VISIT	8
(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS FOR PRIMARY SPECIALIZED ACCREDITATION (EX-ANTE)	9
6.1. Standard "Management of the educational program"	9
6.2. Information Management and Reporting Standard	13
6.3. Standard "Development and approval of the educational program"	15
6.4. Standard "Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of educational programs"	18
6.5. Student-Centered Learning, Teaching and Assessment Standard.....	21
6.6. Standard "Students"	22
6.7. Standard "Teaching Staff"	25
6.8. Standard "Educational resources and student support systems"	29
6.9. Public Information Standard.....	31
(VII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICE FOR EACH STANDARD	34
(VIII) OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVING QUALITY	35
(IX) OVERVIEW OF THE RECOMMENDATION FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION	36
(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION BOARD	36
Appendix 1. Evaluation table "PARAMETERS OF THE SPECIALIZED PROFILE (EX- ANTE)"	37
Appendix 3. RESULTS OF THE PPP QUESTIONNAIRE.....	45

(I) LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

ECTS	European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System
AIS	Automated information system
BD	Basic disciplines
HEI	Higher education institution
EEC	External expert commission
SUC	State utility company
SUC on REM	State utility company on the right of economic management
SCES	<u>State Compulsory Educational Standard</u>
GU	government agency
UNT	Unified National Testing
ICT	Information and Communication Technologies
IT	Information Technology
CSI	Communal state institution
CQAES of MES RK	Committee for Quality Assurance in Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
CTA	Comprehensive testing of applicants
KazNAA	Kazakh National Academy of Arts
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
MES RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MEP	Modular educational program
IAAR	Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating
NAS RK	National Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Kazakhstan
SRI	Scientific research institute
RW	Research work
NCE	National Chamber of Entrepreneurs
NTSSTE	National Center for State Scientific and Technical Expertise
GED	General education disciplines
EP	Educational program
MD	Major disciplines
TS	Teaching staff
RK	Republic of Kazakhstan
REMC	Republican Educational and Methodological Council
WC	Working curriculum
Mass Media	Mass media
SSW	Student's self-work
SSWT	Student's self-work with teacher
LLP	Limited Liability Partnership
TTA	Technical training aids
EMA	Educational-methodical association
EMW	Educational and methodical work
EMC	Educational and Methodological Council

(II) INTRODUCTION

In accordance with the order No. 74-22-OD dated on March 25, 2022 of the General Director of the National Institution "Independent Accreditation and Rating Agency" from May 31 to June 2, 2022, an external expert commission assessed the quality of educational programs as **8D02108 - Decorative arts** for compliance with the standards of primary specialized accreditation of educational programs of organizations of higher and (or) postgraduate education (Ex-ante) of the IAAR (Order No. 68-18 / 1-OD dated on May 25, 2018).

The report of the external expert commission (EEC) contains an assessment of educational programs **8D02108 - Decorative arts** to the IAAR criteria, recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of the educational program and profile parameters of educational programs.

The composition of the EEC:

Chairman of the EEC – Karchevskaya Natalya Vladimirovna, Candidate of Art History, Associate Professor, Rector of the Belarusian State University of Culture and Arts (Minsk, Republic of Belarus).

EEC coordinator – Niyazova Guliyash Balkenovna, Head of the Project for the institutional and specialized accreditation of IAAR universities (Nur-Sultan, Republic of Kazakhstan).

Cluster 1. Primary specialized accreditation

7M02166 Theater directing *IAAR expert* – Saitova Gulnara Yusupovna, Candidate of Art History, Professor of the Kazakh National Academy of Choreography (Nur-Sultan, Republic of Kazakhstan).

7M02162 Acting art *IAAR expert, Employer* – Bakharov Dilmurat Nurakhmetovich, Honored Worker of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Director of the State Republican Academic Uighur Theater of Musical Comedy named after K.Kuzhamyarov (Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan).

7M02159 Traditional musical art *IAAR expert* – Mirmanov Naku Bahautdinovich, Honored Educator, Head of the Department of Kyzylorda University named after Korkyt Ata (Kyzylorda, Republic of Kazakhstan).

IAAR expert, student – Ablaev Samat Almatovich, 1st year student of EP 7M01407 Musical education at Kyzylorda University named after Korkyt Ata (Kyzylorda, Republic of Kazakhstan).

Cluster 2. Primary specialized accreditation

7M02154 Film and TV directing *IAAR expert* – Kenzikeev Ruslan Vladimirovich, PhD, Head of the Pedagogy Department of the Kazakh National Academy of Choreography (Nur-Sultan, Republic of Kazakhstan).

7M02161 Art management *IAAR expert* – Berdnik Tatyana Olegovna, Candidate of Philosophical Sciences, Professor.

IAAR expert, student – Kereeva Tansholpan Makhambetovna, 2nd year student of the educational program 7M04106 Marketing at Aktobe Regional University named after K.Zhubanov (Aktobe, Republic of Kazakhstan).

Cluster 3. Primary specialized accreditation

7M02167 Graphics *IAAR expert* – Bodikov Seyfolla Zhamauovich, Senior Lecturer, Karaganda State University named after Academician E.A.Buketov, member of the Union of Designers of the Republic of Kazakhstan, member of the Eurasian Union of Designers (Karaganda, Republic of Kazakhstan).

7M02158 Decorative arts

IAAR expert, student – Laura Kanatkyzy Kalmukhambetova, 4th year student of EP 5B042100 Graphic Design at Taraz Regional University named after M.Kh.Dulati (Taraz, Republic of Kazakhstan).

7M02169 Fashion and costume design

IAAR expert – Kudabayeva Aigul Kaldybekovna, Candidate of Technical Sciences, Associate Professor, Taraz Regional University named after M.Kh.Dulati (Taraz, Republic of Kazakhstan).

Cluster 4. Primary specialized accreditation

8D02102 Painting

IAAR expert – Marieta Savcheva, Doctor of Arts and Fine Arts, Professor at St.Kliment Ohridsky Sofia University (Sofia, Bulgaria).

IAAR expert, student – Zeinolla Assel Ardakkyzy, 2nd year student of the EP Visual arts, graphics and design at the Arkalyk Pedagogical Institute named after Y.Altynsarin (Arkalyk, Republic of Kazakhstan).

8D02108 Applied arts

IAAR expert – Zhanerke Askhatovna Imanbayeva, Associate Professor of the International Educational Corporation (Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan).

IAAR expert, student – Muftigalieva Aliya Adietovna, 1st year student of EP 7M07320 Architecture at the Eurasian National University named after L.N.Gumilyov (Nur-Sultan, Republic of Kazakhstan).

Cluster 5. Specialized accreditation

8D02184 Film and TV directing

IAAR expert – Chuprinsky Andrei Ivanovich, PhD, Associate Professor of the Belarusian State Academy of Arts (Minsk, Republic of Belarus).

IAAR expert, employer – Pilipenko Yuri Alexandrovich, Chairman of the International Association of Producers of Goods and Services “Expobest” (Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan).

IAAR expert, student – Pak Sofia Aleksandrovna, student of EP 6B02101 Directing at Turan University (Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan).

(III) INTRODUCTION

In accordance with by order No. 74-22-BD dated March 25, 2022 of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating, from May 31 to June 2, 2022, an external expert commission assessed the compliance of educational programs 8D02102 Painting, 8D02108 Decorative Arts of the Republican State institutions of the “ T.K. Zhurgenov Kazakh National Academy of Arts ” of the MCS RK to the standards of primary specialized accreditation of the IAAR (dated May 25,

2018 No. 68-18 / 1-BD, first edition) in a hybrid format.

The report of the external expert commission (EEC) contains an assessment of educational programs 8D02102 Painting, 8D02108 Decorative arts to the IAAR criteria, recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of educational programs, evaluation tables of profile parameters, the EEC visit program, the results of a survey of teachers and students of educational programs of the Republican State Institution " T.K. Zhurgenov Kazakh National Academy of Arts.

(IV) REPRESENTATION OF EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION

The Academy has six faculties: 1) Theatrical art 2) Film and TV; 3) Choreography; 4) Painting, sculpture, and design; 5) Art history; 6) Musical art. Training of specialists is carried out by 23 departments, of which 17 are graduating, 6 are general academic.

Multi-stage training of specialists in the field of art consists of five educational levels: boarding school - grades 7-9 (initial art training), college (technical and vocational education), university (higher specialized education), postgraduate education - master's and doctoral studies (PhD) opened since 2009.

For the first time in Kazakhstan in T.Zhurgenov KazNAA Doctorate (PhD) was opened in 7 educational art programs (2009). Thanks to the study of international experience in the training of art specialists, the Academy opened 10 scientific and practical centers for postgraduate education, scientific and creative laboratories, as well as the Dissertation Council for the defense of dissertations in the specialties of art.

Currently, the preparation of bachelors, masters and doctoral students in all EPs is carried out on the basis of license No. KZ71LAA00005325 dated July 14, 2015, issued by the Committee for Control in Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 3, 2010 No. 0137419.

The educational program 8D02102 Painting and 8D02108 Decorative Arts involves the preparation of doctoral students in the scientific and pedagogical direction (3 years of study) with the award of a Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) degree.

The degree rate at the university is 44.4%, the average age of the teaching staff of the university is 57 years.

Information about the personal composition of the teaching staff of the EP or GOP: the quality of teaching staff-163, Doctor of Science - 7, professors /KOKSON/ - 34, people's artists - 5, candidates of science - 60, associate professors /KKSON/ - 37, PhD doctors - 26, honored artists and figures - 43, holders of state awards - 36.

The educational process is provided by highly qualified teaching staff.

The staff of the department, to which EP 8D02102 Painting belongs:

The total number of teachers of the department as of 03/01/2022 is 25 (full-time - 25) people, including: 8 - candidates of science, 2 - PhD, 15 - masters.

staffing department to which the EP belongs: 8D02108 Decorative Arts:

The total number of teachers of the department as of 03/01/2022 is 14 (full-time - 11) people, including: 4 - candidates of science, 7 - masters.

The base department of the EP is the department of "Decorative Art" and "Fine Arts" of the faculty "Painting, Sculpture and Design" Head of the Department of Decorative Arts, Professor of the Higher Attestation Commission Bazarbayeva Raushan Yerkenovna is a Kazakh artist of decorative art, a cultural figure of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Head of the Department of Fine Arts Turgynbay Bolat Syrlashovich muralist, teacher, Honored Worker of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The volume of the library fund of the university "T.K. Zhurgenov Kazakh National Academy of, EP as of December 1, 2021 on physical (tangible) media is 256983 copies (116415 titles), of which 162720 are educational publications, 5624 scientific publications. By subscription, the library has 89 titles (330 copies) of newspapers and magazines.

The management of the educational program carries out its activities in the preparation of graduates in these specialties on the basis of the Laws of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education", the charter of the university, the curriculum and programs of disciplines developed in the prescribed manner, orders of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the rector of the university, decisions of the Academic Council of the university, as well as other regulations and documents.

(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE

Conformity assessment of educational programs 8D02102 Painting, 8D02108 Decorative arts RSI "T.K. Zhurgenov Kazakh National Academy of Arts " standards of primary specialized accreditation of the educational program (Ex-ante) of higher and (or) postgraduate education (put into effect by the order of the director of NU "IAAR" No. 68-18 / 1-OD dated May 25, 2018) are held for the first time.

(VI) DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC VISIT

The work of the EEC was carried out based on the approved Program of the hybrid visit of the expert commission for primary specialized accreditation of educational programs T. Zhurgenov KazNAA from May 31 to June 2, 2022.

To coordinate the work of the EEC, on May 28, 2022, an on-line kick-off meeting was held, during which powers were distributed among the members of the commission, the schedule of the visit was clarified, and agreement was reached on the choice of examination methods.

To obtain objective information about the quality of educational programs and the entire infrastructure of the university, to clarify the content of self-assessment reports, meetings were held with the rector, vice-rectors of the university in areas of activity, heads of structural divisions, heads of departments, teachers, students, graduates, employers. A total of 25 representatives took part in the meetings (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information about employees and students who took part in meetings with the EEC IAAR:

Participant category	Quantity
Rector	one
Vice-Rector's Corps	2
Heads of structural divisions	7
Deans	4
Heads of departments	7
teachers	4
Students, undergraduates, doctoral students	0
Graduates	0
Employers	0
Total	25

During the visual inspection, the EEC members got acquainted with the state of the material and technical base, visited specialized rooms and workshops, production workshops, a registrar office, computer and lecture rooms, and a conference room. The infrastructure of the EP "Painting" includes 8 specialized rooms and workshops, equipped with easels, staging materials, paintings.

For (GED) Basic disciplines there are classrooms with interactive whiteboards. EP "Decorative Art" 8 specialized rooms and 4 production workshops.

At the meetings of the EEC IAAR with the target groups of the university, the mechanisms for implementing the policy of the university were clarified and certain data presented in the self-assessment report of the university were specified.

Members of the EEC in a hybrid format visited the practice bases of accredited programs: IE "Dzhanseitova", LLP publishing house "Mektep".

In accordance with the accreditation procedure, a survey of 5 teachers was conducted (Appendix 3), students did not take part, since there is no contingent on these EPs since 2018.

To confirm the information presented in the Self-Assessment Report, the working documentation of the university was requested and analyzed by external experts. Along with this, the experts studied the Internet positioning of the university through the official website of the university. <https://www.kaznai.kz>.

As part of the planned program, recommendations for improving the accredited educational programs of T. Zhurgenov KazNAA, developed by the EEC based on the results of the examination, were presented at a meeting with the management on 06/02/2022.

(VII) COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS OF PRIMARY SPECIALIZED ACCREDITATION (EX-ANTE)

6.1. Standard "Management of the educational program"

- ✓ *The university must demonstrate the development of the goal and EP development strategies based on the analysis of external and internal factors with the wide involvement of various stakeholders.*
- ✓ *The quality assurance policy should reflect the relationship between research, teaching, and learning.*
- ✓ *The university demonstrates the development of a culture of quality assurance.*
- ✓ *Commitment to quality assurance should apply to any activity performed by contractors and partners (outsourcing), including the implementation of joint / double degree education and academic mobility.*
- ✓ *The management of the EP ensures the transparency of the development plan for the development of the EP based on an analysis of its functioning, the real positioning of the university and the focus of its activities on meeting the needs of students, the state, employers, and other stakeholders.*
- ✓ *The EP management demonstrates the functioning of the mechanisms for the formation and regular revision of the EP development plan and monitoring its implementation, assessing the achievement of learning goals, meeting the needs of students, employers, and society, making decisions aimed at continuous improvement of the EP.*
- ✓ *The EP management should involve representatives of stakeholder groups, including employers, students and teaching staff in the formation of the EP development plan.*
- ✓ *The leadership of the EP must demonstrate individuality and uniqueness EP development plan, its consistency with national development priorities and development strategy of the educational organization.*
- ✓ *The university must demonstrate a clear definition of those responsible for business processes within the EP, the distribution of staff duties, and the delimitation of the functions of collegial bodies.*
- ✓ *The management of the EP ensures the coordination of the activities of all persons involved in the development and management of the EP, and its continuous implementation, and also involves all interested parties in this process.*
- ✓ *The EP management must ensure the transparency of the management system, the functioning of the internal quality assurance system, including its design, management and monitoring, and the adoption of appropriate decisions.*
- ✓ *The management of the EP should carry out risk management.*
- ✓ *Management of EP should ensure the participation of representatives of stakeholders (employers, teaching staff, students) in the collegiate management bodies of the educational program, as well as their representativeness in making decisions on the management of the educational program.*
- ✓ *The university must demonstrate innovation management within the EP, including the analysis and implementation of innovative proposals.*
- ✓ *The management of the EP must demonstrate its openness and accessibility for students, teaching staff, employers and other interested parties.*
- ✓ *The management of the EP confirms the completion of training in education management programs.*
- ✓ *Management of the EP PR should strive to ensure that the progress made since the last external quality assurance procedure is taken into account when preparing for the next procedure.*

Evidence

T.K. Zhurgenov KazNAA carries out its activities based on a quality assurance policy. The quality assurance policy is reflected in the document “Quality Policy of T.K. Zhurgenov KazNAA. This document is posted on the website of T.K. Zhurgenov KazNAA. The quality assurance policy reflects the general principles of the academy for quality assurance and the development of a culture of quality. The quality policy is correlated with the mission of the academy, the Development Strategy of T.K. Zhurgenov KazNAA for 2016-2026, the academic policy of the university. The accessibility of the quality assurance policy to the teaching staff, employees and students is evidenced by the facts of familiarization and discussion at the departments, familiarization of students during the adaptation week, meetings of the heads of the academy and faculties with parents, discussions of educational programs with employers. The Academy presents a system of strategic development for 2016 - 2026, including considering the formation of competitive specialists in Kazakhstan, based on the integration of education, science and production. The development plans of the accredited EP “8D02108 - Decorative Arts” and 8D02102 Painting” are fully coordinated and built according to the requirements and parameters of the strategy and mission, vision, and values of T.K. Zhurgenov KazNAA.

The development plan and goals of EP 8D02108 Decorative Arts and 8D02102 Painting are developed in accordance with the Strategic Development Plan and the main documents regulating the activities of the academy in areas, formed on the basis of an analysis of financial, informational, labor, material and technical resources, correspond to the mission of the academy and represent the implementation of prospects and solution of specific tasks within the framework of strategic directions.

The policy of academic quality of KazNAA is based on the mission, vision and is part of the strategic management of the academy and is implemented at all levels of the educational organization. The policy of academic quality is agreed with the Program for its development, adopted at the meeting of the Academic Council in 2020 (Minutes of the meeting of the Board of Directors No. 3 of 10/29/2020)

More attention is paid to attracting teachers with industrial experience. Leading teachers of the Department of Fine Arts (Kairanbaev D., Bapanov A.K., Turgynbay B.S., Baydilda B.N., Mukanov M.F., Kairanov E.B.) and the Department of Decorative Arts (Bazarbayeva R.E., Bapanova S.S., Daubaev E.S., Beristenov Zh.T.) influence not only the cultural policy of the country, but also scientific research in the field of art.

The leadership of the EP demonstrated the transparency of the processes of formation of the EP Development Plan and its consistency with the national development priorities and the development strategy of the Academy. The uniqueness and individuality of the accredited EP lies in the fact that the educational program is developed based on a competency-based approach and the introduction of modern educational technologies and teaching methods into the educational process. The fulfillment of the key requirements of the stakeholders and the improvement of the content of the EP is carried out through the activities of the Academy's collegiate management bodies (the Academic Council of the Academy, the Academic Council of the Faculty, the Academic Council of the Academy, the Educational and Methodological Bureau of the Faculty.) that ensure consistency, transparency and openness of decision-making based on the mechanism of interaction.

The EP development plan is a basic open document and can be changed by making corrective amendments according to the annual analysis of the effectiveness of the implementation of educational programs. Monitoring the effectiveness of the implementation of the development plan of the EP is systematically carried out by the educational and methodological bureau of the faculty, EMC, SOiMUP and other services of the academy. Monitoring is aimed at improving the quality of the educational process in order to make the necessary adjustments to ongoing educational programs in a timely manner.

The development plan for accredited EPs was built considering new approaches to the development of educational programs in the context of the modernization of the Kazakhstani

education system, taking into account the dynamically changing characteristics of the modern market and trends in interaction with the world community. The experts noted that the need to update the content and mechanisms for the implementation of accredited educational programs is dictated, among other things, by its specificity and the need to simultaneously preserve the elements of the academic model of art education that underlies the national school of fine arts and the harmonious implementation of global educational trends.

Quality assurance policy reflects the relationship between research, teaching, learning and takes into account both the national and intra-university context. This connection is expressed in the use of research results in the educational process and in the implementation of doctoral dissertations, as well as in the organization of round tables, conferences, meetings, scientific research, and the publication of various manuals. The connection between scientific research, teaching and learning is reflected in the intensification of research and innovation activities, the search for innovative forms of education that allow attracting gifted doctoral students to participate in research work.

Continuous introduction of ICT in the educational process, a favorable research environment (moral, financial and technical support for scientists, including young scientists), systematic improvement of the system of material and technical, information base, active social life of students, relationships between the administration, teaching staff and students, based on mutual respect, mutual understanding, mutual assistance, excellent working and learning conditions.

The individuality and uniqueness of the development plans for accredited educational programs lies in the actualization of the content of the programs, the introduction of new trajectories that have no analogues in the Republic of Kazakhstan. The educational process is aimed at training specialists who are able to make changes in the business environment in the field of culture and art, who own innovative technologies in the visual arts, who know how to successfully promote them in the market. The development plans of the EP "Painting" and "Decorative Art" correspond to the Development Strategy of T.K. Zhurgenov KazNAA.

The formation of the EP begins with the definition of its goals and objectives, a list of general and professional competencies from the definition of the list of modules and disciplines of the cycle of major disciplines:

- the goal of EP 8D02102 Painting and EP 8D02108 Decorative Arts "To train a specialist capable of solving modern scientific and practical problems both in the field of history and theory, criticism of domestic and world painting, decorative arts and in the system of higher and postgraduate education, in the management field; synthesizing in its activities professional scientific knowledge (including innovative) and experience in the field of fine arts at the intersection of areas of humanitarian knowledge.

The results of external and internal monitoring, including the monitoring of the opinion of employers about the professional qualities of graduates, the satisfaction of teaching staff with working conditions, the analysis of which will be discussed at meetings of departments, faculties at the end of the academic year, respectively, in the presence of students, are determined as indicators of the effectiveness of achieving the goals to be accredited.

Representatives of the production sector, practitioners, and external reviewers participate in the process of reviewing the content of the EP and propose topics for current elective courses, which, because of a general discussion, are included in the EP. For example, in EP 8D02108 Decorative Arts, 7 disciplines were updated, considering the specifics of the MOP and the needs of the labor market. Disciplines such as: "Art, visual anthropology and the creation of the modern world (author's course)", "Design of contemporary art", "Mass and elite art of Kazakhstan", etc.

The leaders of the EP demonstrate and maintain their openness to communicate with various stakeholder groups. At the level of the rector, not only the possibilities of written communication are provided, including the use of modern technologies (the rector's blog), but also openness through social networks, including what was confirmed by the teaching staff and students in interviews with the EEC. The rector, vice-rectors, dean and head of the department are in close

contact with undergraduates and teaching staff, their availability was confirmed by the participants of the interviews conducted by the EEC members.

According to the results of the survey of teaching staff and students, the following answers were received to the questions:

- to what extent teachers can use their own strategies - satisfactory answers of 100% of the interviewed teaching staff;
- to what extent teachers can use their own innovations in the learning process - satisfactory answers from 100% of the surveyed teaching staff;
- assessment of the accessibility of the dean's office for students - satisfactory answers of 100% of the students surveyed;
- assessment of the degree of academic freedom of the teaching staff - satisfactory answers of 86.7% of the surveyed teaching staff;
- the involvement of teaching staff in the process of making managerial and strategic decisions - satisfactory answers of 93.4% of respondents;
- encouragement of innovative activity of teaching staff - satisfactory answers of 73.3% of respondents;
- the level of feedback from the teaching staff with the management - satisfactory answers of 80% of the respondents;
- assessment of the management and administration of the university criticism in their address - satisfactory answers 86.7% of respondents;
- satisfaction of students with the level of accessibility and responsiveness of the university management - satisfactory answers of 100% of respondents.

Analytical part

EEC notes that the academy has a multi-channel feedback system focused on students, employees and stakeholders. Stakeholders can submit requests in the following ways:

- post your questions, comments, wishes on the rector's blog or contact the academy website manager and other departments using contacts in the Faculty's Call Center, through the Telegram application;
- apply personally to supervisors, heads of departments, deans, heads of departments, vice-rectors, rector.

During interviews, the leadership of the academy demonstrated its readiness for openness and accessibility to all interested parties.

Representatives from the teaching staff are involved in the development plans, this was confirmed in interviews with target groups. To confirm the involvement of potential employers in the formation of EP development plans, an examination was presented for educational programs, which are evidence of their participation in the development of EP development plans.

EEC experts note the absence of QED on the website of the academy in the public domain.

It should be noted the absence in the development plans of the EP of sections that would contain an analysis of possible risks in the implementation of the EP, a description of measures to prevent and overcome them.

EEC experts were provided with confirmation of training in the management of EP 4 of the cluster on management programs in education.

EEC experts are not confirmation of innovation management within the EP was provided, including the absence of the implementation of innovative proposals, which was confirmed during interviews with teaching staff.

Strengths / best practice for accredited EPs:

- demonstrated the evidence of the openness and accessibility of the EP for students, teaching staff, employers and other interested parties.

EEC recommendations on E P 8D02108 Decorative Arts and 8D02102 Painting:

1. The management of the accredited EPs should include in the EP development plan a section describing possible risks in the implementation of the accredited EPs, indicating the names of risks, possible consequences, a description of the mechanisms and risk management measures by September 1, 2022.

2. The management of accredited EPs to develop mechanisms for monitoring the effectiveness of EP development, innovation management within the EP, including the analysis and implementation of innovative proposals until 01.01.2023.

EEC conclusions:

According to the standard "Management of the educational program" for EP8D02108 Decorative Arts disclosed 15 criteria, of which 1 - have a strong position, 12 - satisfactory, 2 - require improvement.

According to the standard "Management of the educational program" for EP8D02102 Painting disclosed 15 criteria, of which 1 - have a strong position, 14 - satisfactory.

6.2. Information Management and Reporting Standard

✓ The university must ensure the functioning of the system for collecting, analyzing and managing information based on modern information and communication technologies and software.

✓ The EP guidance demonstrates the systematic use of processed, adequate information to improve the internal quality assurance system.

✓ The management of the EP demonstrates the presence of a reporting system that reflects the activities of all structural units and departments within the EP, including an assessment of their performance.

✓ The university must determine the frequency, forms, and methods for assessing the management of the EP, the activities of collegial bodies and structural divisions, top management.

✓ The university must demonstrate a mechanism for ensuring the protection of information, including determining the persons responsible for the reliability and timeliness of the analysis of information and the provision of data.

✓ The university demonstrates the involvement of students, employees, and teaching staff in the processes of collecting and analyzing information, as well as making decisions based on them.

✓ The management of the EP must demonstrate the existence of mechanisms for communication with students, employees and other interested parties, including conflict resolution.

✓ The university must ensure the measurement of the degree of satisfaction with the needs of students, teaching staff and staff within the framework of the EP and demonstrate evidence of the elimination of identified shortcomings.

✓ The university should evaluate the effectiveness and efficiency of activities in the context of the EP.

✓ The information collected and analyzed by the university within the framework of the EP should take into account:

key performance indicators.

the dynamics of the contingent of students in the context of forms and types.

academic performance, student achievement and dropouts.

satisfaction of students with the implementation of the EP and the quality of education at the university.

availability of educational resources and support systems for students.

employment and career growth of graduates.

✓ Students, teaching staff and staff must document their consent to the processing of personal data.

✓ The management of the EP should contribute to the provision of the necessary information in the relevant fields of science.

Evidence

In accordance with the internal regulatory documents of the university, a mechanism for collecting, analyzing and managing information based on modern information and communication technologies and software is regulated, for the purpose of which it has been introduced and is operating university official website www.kaznai.edu.kz). In addition, the management of educational and methodological information is carried out within the framework of the program "PLATONUS" and LMS "MOODLE" (<https://edu.kaznai.kz>). The system provides the ability to manage the academic calendar, the formation of individual plans, the placement of teaching materials, the formation of examination sheets, the current testing of students in the classroom,

and questioning. Data integration means "PLATONUS" and LMS "MOODLE" (<https://edu.kaznai.kz>) ensures the availability of educational resources and support systems for students, obtaining information intended for the operational and strategic management of the university.

Within the framework of the accredited EP, a system of regular reporting is carried out, reflecting the activities of the department as a structural unit that implements this EP, including an assessment of its effectiveness. The Instagram channel of the Department of Fine Arts @korkemsyret_kafedasy and the Department of Decorative Arts @kaznai_dekorative are actively functioning, which contains information on entrance exams, ongoing events, creative projects, etc.

Analytical part

When studying the compliance with the criteria of the standard "Information and Reporting Management" for the accredited EP, the commission notes that the academy has a system collection, analysis and management of information based on the use of ICT and software. The collection and analysis of information is carried out in a systematic manner within the time limits specified by the university. During conversations with the teaching staff, data were confirmed that the main source of information is the internal communications system and the website.

The EEC notes that when reviewing the self-report and visiting the department, it was revealed that the collegiate bodies (Academic Council, Faculty Council, Academic Council) include the head of the department, students (but there is no contingent in this EP) of the initial pedagogical profile. At the same time, during the conversation with the teaching staff, it was revealed that there is no mechanism for appointing persons responsible for the analysis, processing and provision of data, and therefore interested persons are not always aware of the decisions made by the leadership of the university and structural divisions.

The Academy has demonstrated the presence and evidence of the use in the management processes of the EP of a system for collecting and analyzing statistics on the contingent of students, available resources, staffing, research and creative activities, with the help of which it manages both the EP itself and other areas of activity, using a variety of methods. The academy has an open door policy. Regularly, the service for organizing and monitoring the educational process, the anti-corruption department and the air defense department conduct surveys to collect complaints, wishes and suggestions from students and employees; the rector holds meetings with teachers and teaching staff.

According to the personnel policy, the increase in the contribution of each teaching staff in achieving the strategic goals of the academy characterizes and reflects the norms and legal acts that provide a mechanism for resolving conflicts. Experts note that when interviewing with focus groups: faculty members have a clear understanding of the conflict resolution procedure, and all proposals and recommendations of stakeholders are responded to by management decisions. In addition, communication mechanisms with students, employees and other stakeholders include: questioning students and teaching staff, meetings with management, consideration of proposals at meetings of departments, faculties, the administration and the Academic Council of the Academy.

The information and feedback system is focused on students and employees and includes the functioning of the official website of the academy in three languages, however, experts noted that the language representation of the site is not functional enough (there is no information in three languages). Including it is not possible to get acquainted with the achievements and summary of the teaching staff of the departments, there is no up-to-date information about their activities.

As a result of the analysis of compliance with the criteria of this standard, the members of the EEC revealed that the Academy has an information and reporting management system. The databases available at the university allow you to generate a variety of analytical information and reports. The result of this process are decisions taken collectively at the appropriate levels.

In the process of familiarization with the documentation of the university and the Academy with the leadership, it was revealed that the university is actively working on informatization of management activities and documented consent of students, teaching staff and employees for the processing of personal data has been provided. But nevertheless, the definition of the order and

ensuring the protection of information is not fully demonstrated. It is also not clear how the responsible persons responsible for the reliability and timeliness of information analysis and data provision are determined.

The analysis of the EEC of information management and reporting within the framework of the ongoing EP of the Academy showed that the mechanism of regular reporting, reflecting all levels of the structure, including the assessment of the effectiveness and efficiency of scientific research of the teaching staff of the department, requires more precise debugging.

The basic component of the system of motivation and incentives for employees of the academy is the mechanism of material remuneration, which ensures the relationship between remuneration and labor results, as this fact was confirmed in an interview with the teaching staff.

The survey of students, conducted during the online visit of the EEC, was not conducted among doctoral students accredited by the EP due to the lack of a contingent (the statistics of the contingent were analyzed based on the EP data from 2018). The Development Strategy of the Academy does not provide for measures to increase the contingent. There are no items to activate career guidance work.

Strengths / best practice for accredited EPs:

- availability of mechanisms for involving students, employees and teaching staff in the processes of collecting and analyzing information, as well as making decisions based on them.

EEC recommendations for EP 8D02108 Decorative Arts and 8D02102 Painting:

1. The leadership of the academy should regularly update the site, ensuring convenient navigation and access to information, including information about the activities of accredited EPs and in the declared three languages;

2. The leadership of the academy should provide for an assessment of the effectiveness and efficiency of activities, including in the context of EP;

3. The leadership of the academy should provide mechanisms for collecting and analyzing information within the framework of the EP, taking into account key performance indicators until 09/01/2022;

4. The management of accredited EPs should include in the EP development plan a section describing measures to increase the dynamics of the contingent studying before 1.09.2022.

5. The management of the accredited EPs should demonstrate the determination of the procedure and ensuring the protection of information, including the identification of persons responsible for the reliability and timeliness of the analysis of information and the provision of data by the beginning of 2023.

EEC conclusions:

According to the standard "Information Management and Reporting" for EP8D02108 Decorative Arts 16 criteria are disclosed, of which 13 have a satisfactory position, 3 require improvement.

According to the standard "Information Management and Reporting" for EP8D02102 Painting disclosed 16 criteria, of which 1 - have a strong position, 13 - satisfactory, 2 - suggest improvement.

6.3. Standard "Development and approval of the educational program"

✓ The university must demonstrate the existence of a documented procedure for the development of the EP and its approval at the institutional level.

✓ The university must demonstrate the compliance of the developed EP with the established goals and planned learning outcomes.

- ✓ *The management of the EP should determine the influence of disciplines and professional practices on the formation of learning outcomes.*
- ✓ *The university demonstrates the presence of a model of a graduate of the EP, which describes the learning outcomes and personal qualities.*
- ✓ *The qualification awarded upon completion of the EP must be clearly defined, explained and correspond to a certain level of the NSC, QF-EHEA.*
- ✓ *The management of the EP must demonstrate the modular structure of the program based on ECTS, ensure that the structure of the content of the EP corresponds to the goals set, with a focus on achieving the planned learning outcomes for each graduate.*
- ✓ *The management of the EP should ensure that the content of academic disciplines and learning outcomes correspond to each other and to the level of education (bachelor's, master's, doctoral studies).*
- ✓ *The management of the EP must demonstrate the conduct of external reviews of the EP.*
- ✓ *The management of the EP must provide evidence of the participation of students, teaching staff and other stakeholders in the development and quality assurance of the EP.*
- ✓ *The management of the EP must demonstrate the uniqueness of the educational program, its positioning in the educational market (regional/national/international).*
- ✓ *An important factor is the possibility of preparing students for professional certification.*
- ✓ *An important factor is the presence of a joint (s) and / or two-degree EP with foreign universities.*

The university independently develops the EP, taking into account the Dublin descriptors and the European Qualifications Framework, in accordance with the Classifier of areas for training personnel with higher and postgraduate education, the requirements of the State Educational Standard, regulatory legal acts of the field of higher and postgraduate education, as well as the Academic policy of KazNAA (https://kaznai.kz/wp-content/uploads/2021/09/%D0%90%D0%BA%D0%B0%D0%B4%D0%B5%D0%BC.-%D0%BF%D0%BE%D0%BB%D0%B8%D1%82%D0%B8%D0%BA%D0%B0_2021.pdf).

The Academy demonstrates the compliance of the developed EP with the established goals and planned learning outcomes.

The main goal of the EP is formed taking into account the specifics of the training of competitive scientific and pedagogical personnel, aimed at the formation of readiness students to pedagogical, research and socio-pedagogical activities. The EP includes academic disciplines that ensure the formation of professional competencies in future doctoral students that are necessary for a future teacher. Courses of disciplines in the educational program are associated with expected learning outcomes in the field of study. At the design stage of the EP, the department developed a graduate competency model that reflects the learning outcomes and competencies that graduates should have after completing the EP training. In the competence model of a graduate, the goal, area, object of professional activity, functions and types of professional activity are defined. During conversations with the head of the EP and teaching staff, it was clarified that the content of the EP contains the basic requirements for the graduate, they meet the qualification requirements.

EP "8D02108 - Decorative Arts" and "8D02102 - Painting" are aimed at training doctoral students in the field and guarantee a high level of training of specialists. The content and structure of the EP cluster are developed in accordance with the Qualification characteristics of doctoral studies in the corresponding GOP.

EP "8D02108 - Decorative Arts" and "8D02102 - Painting" correspond to the goals and expected learning outcomes, personal development of students. They reflect the components that form personal development, creative abilities, professional competencies of students. The EP includes disciplines aimed at achieving goals, achieving expected results, developing the professional and personal qualities of students.

The order and procedure for the development and approval of the EP are based on the following documents:

- "Guidelines for the design of modular educational programs" (Approved on 11/06/2020);
- "Regulations on the organization of the educational process with the use of distance learning technologies in T.K. Zhurgenov Kazakh National Academy of Arts. "

The results of the survey of teaching staff showed that they were satisfied with:

- scientific and professional interests and needs of teaching staff by the content of the educational program - 100%;
 - paying attention to the content of the educational program by the management of the educational institution - 93.4%;
 - the focus of educational programs / curricula on the formation of students' skills and abilities to analyze situations and make forecasts - 93.31%;
 - compliance of the educational program in terms of content and quality of implementation with the expectations of the labor market and employers 46.7% - full agreement, 53.3% - agree.
- Students from accredited EPs did not pass the survey, due to the lack of a contingent.

Analytical part

As noted above, and Analysis of the accredited EP for compliance with the criteria of the standard "Development and approval of an educational program" shows that the content of educational programs, their sequence in all areas of training comply with regulatory requirements. EP 8D02108 Decorative Arts and 8D02102 Painting correspond to a certain level of the NSC and are included in the Register of Educational Programs of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The developed competence model of the EP graduate is comparable with the descriptors (A, B, C, D, E) of the corresponding level of education.

The university conducts an external examination of the EP, initiating regular expert reviews.

The modular structure of the program, based on ECTS, ensures the achievement of the set goal, the planned learning outcomes for each student.

According to the developed EP, which provides for the possibility of building an individual educational trajectory, considering the personal needs and capabilities of students, models of graduates have been developed. The graduate model includes the result of learning, as well as universal, organizational, managerial, and professional competencies. The formation of the Graduate Model is carried out with the aim of preparing personnel in demand on the labor market and involves determining the structure of the EP, the content and sequence of studying disciplines. However, the EEC notes the need to present the Models of EP graduates in accordance with the levels of the International Standard Classification of Education. EEC experts note the lack of implementation of joint EPs accredited by EP 8D02108 Decorative Arts and 8D02102 Painting.

Strengths / best practice EP8D02108 Decorative arts: not found

Strengths / best practice EP8D02102 Painting:

- the management of the EP determined the influence of disciplines and professional practices on the formation of learning outcomes;
- the management of the EP ensured that the content of the EP complied with the established goals, including the intended learning outcomes.

EEC recommendations on EP 8D02108 Decorative Arts and 8D02102 Painting:

1. The management of accredited EPs, when developing models of graduates, to ensure a competency-based approach in accordance with the levels of the International Standard Classification of Education until 01.01.2023;
2. The management of the accredited EPs to develop an action plan to harmonize the content of the EP with similar EPs of domestic and foreign universities in order to form and implement joint EPs on 01.12.2022.

EEC conclusions:

According to the standard Development and approval of educational programs» EP 8D02108 Decorative Arts disclosed 11 criteria, 11 of which are satisfactory positions.

According to the standard «Development and approval of educational programs» EP 8D02102 Painting disclosed 11 criteria, of which 2 are strong, 8 are satisfactory, 1 suggests improvement.

6.4. Standard "Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of educational programs"

- ✓ *The university must ensure the revision of the structure and content of the EP, considering changes in the labor market, the requirements of employers and the social demand of society.*
- ✓ *The university must demonstrate the existence of a documented procedure for monitoring and periodic evaluation to achieve the goal of the EP and continuously improve the EP.*
- ✓ *Monitoring and periodic evaluation of the EP should consider:*
 - the content of the program in the context of the latest achievements of science and technology in a particular discipline.*
 - changes in the needs of society and the professional environment.*
 - workload, performance, and graduation of students.*
 - the effectiveness of student assessment procedures.*
 - needs and degree of satisfaction of students.*
 - compliance of the educational environment and the activities of support services with the goals of the EP.*
- ✓ *The management of the EP should publish information about changes to the EP, inform interested parties about any planned or undertaken actions within the EP.*
- ✓ *Support services should identify the needs of different groups of learners and their degree of satisfaction organization of training, teaching, assessment, development of the EP.*

To improve the EP and meet the needs of all stakeholders, the university has defined its own requirements for the format of monitoring and periodic evaluation and revision of educational programs. The university monitors and periodically evaluates the EP to ensure the achievement of the goal and meet the needs of students and society. The results of these processes are aimed at continuous improvement of the EP, considering changes in the labor market, the requirements of employers and the social demand of society.

Compliance with the needs of consumers is ensured by the involvement of representatives of practice bases and employers in the development of QEDs. But EEC experts note the absence of QED on the academy's website in the public domain. Based on the results of monitoring the satisfaction of the needs of students and employers, changes in the EP aimed at improving the EP are considered.

Analysis of the correspondence of the title and content of disciplines to the current trends in the development of science is carried out by reviewing the EP and QEDs by employers. To be more client-oriented, the university provides feedback and an information system. Innovative proposals from interested parties to improve the activities of the EP can be received through e-mail, telephone, video conferences, publications on the university website, business meetings.

Every year, the Academy conducts a survey of teaching staff, employees, and students. The data of the questionnaires are processed and used as an analytical document in the field of improving the management of the university and the EP. Based on the interviews with the teaching staff and students, the data on the regularity of surveys and questionnaires were confirmed. The teaching staff indicated that the results of the surveys are discussed at the meetings of the departments.

Analytical part

Stakeholders are informed of any planned or undertaken actions in relation to the OP. Information is provided through the official website of the Academy www.kaznai.edu.kz. However, the commission of the EEC notes the absence of a mechanism for informing all interested

parties about any planned or undertaken actions in relation to accredited EPs on the website of the academy. The university does not publish information about the changes made to the EP.

The content of the programs in the light of the latest scientific achievements is constantly reviewed to ensure the relevance of the disciplines taught. When revising the EP, the opinions of employers and students are considered. The disciplines included in the QED reflect the current trends in the area under study and are compiled considering the logical sequence of their study. QED includes disciplines aimed at developing a creative personality and forming the professional competencies of students.

Strengths / best practice EP8D02108 Decorative arts and 8D02102 Painting: not found.

EEC recommendations on EP 8D02108 Decorative Arts and EP 8D02102 Painting:

The management of accredited EPs should regularly ensure the publication of the results of the changes made on the website of the academy, as well as in various media about any planned or undertaken actions related to the implementation of the EP.

EEC conclusions:

According to the standard Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of educational programs» EP 8D02108 Decorative Arts disclosed 10 criteria, of which 7 are satisfactory positions, 3 require improvement.

According to the standard Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of educational programs» EP 8D02102 Painting disclosed 10 criteria, 10 of which are satisfactory positions.

6.5. Student-Centered Learning, Teaching and Assessment Standard

✓ The management of the EP should ensure respect and attention to the various groups of students and their needs, providing them with flexible learning paths.

✓ The management of the EP should ensure teaching based on modern achievements of world science and practice in the field of training, the use of various modern methods of teaching and evaluating learning outcomes that ensure the achievement of the goals of the EP, including competencies, skills to perform scientific work at the required level.

✓ The management of the EP should determine the mechanisms for distributing the teaching load of students between theory and practice within the framework of the EP, ensuring the mastery of the content and achievement of the objectives of the EP by each graduate.

✓ An important factor is the presence of own research in the field of teaching methods of EP disciplines.

✓ The university must ensure that the procedures for evaluating learning outcomes correspond to the planned results and goals of the EP.

✓ The university must ensure the consistency, transparency, and objectivity of the mechanism for assessing the learning outcomes of the EP, the publication of criteria and assessment methods in advance.

✓ Assessors should be proficient in modern methods of evaluating learning outcomes and regularly improve their skills in this area.

✓ The EP management must demonstrate the existence of a feedback system on the use of various teaching methods and the assessment of learning outcomes.

✓ The management of the EP must demonstrate support for the autonomy of learners, while being guided and assisted by the teacher.

✓ The management of the EP must demonstrate the existence of a procedure for responding to complaints from students.

Evidence

The development plan for accredited EPs is student-oriented and is aimed at realizing the potential of a doctoral student in modern labor market conditions, which includes the introduction of an individual trajectory for doctoral studies in the chosen EP (selection of elective disciplines, faculty, etc.).

Teaching staff and employees of T. Zhurgenov KazNAA strive for high professionalism, constantly work to improve the level of their theoretical knowledge, pedagogical and creative skills, are principled and objective in relation to colleagues, students and to themselves.

The activities of students include determining the content of the EP "8D02108 - Decorative Arts" and EP "8D02102 - Painting", independent formation of the educational trajectory, the choice of a teacher, assessment of the level of effectiveness of training and teaching methods, assessment of the professional qualities of teaching staff, assessment of the level of material and technical support of the educational process and sanitary condition of classrooms and premises.

Technologies are also used to include students in various types of activities - design and creative, research, artistic, search. The technologies of contextual and problem-based learning are of the greatest importance here, during which the student learns to solve creative or scientific problems, specific professional tasks. Many teachers use interesting pedagogical technologies to enhance the educational, creative and scientific activities of students. Moreover, these technologies are student-oriented, developing critical and creative thinking of students. The teachers of the department are the authors of monographs, textbooks, manuals and articles in the field of fine arts research.

The student has the right to appeal the results of the ranking and the final exam. For the period of the examination session, an appeal commission is created from among the teaching staff, whose qualifications correspond to the profile of the disciplines.

Analytical part

Teaching staff of accredited EPs use traditional and interactive teaching methods as part of the educational process. During an interview with the teaching staff, it was noted that there is no mechanism for supporting teachers with creative and scientific activities.

To date, the main resource of the educational process in the implementation of the goals of the EP is the teaching staff, which carries out the educational process, meets the qualification requirements for licensing educational activities, has full knowledge, owns modern teaching methods, the necessary skills and experience for the effective transfer of knowledge to students. According to paragraphs 30 and 82 of the state general educational standard for postgraduate education and annex 8 to the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 10/31/2018. No. 604 "On the approval of state general educational standards of education at all levels" the list of scientific supervisors of postgraduate education does not fully comply.

The quality of the teaching staff is 100%. The EEC revealed the readiness of the EP for implementation since all quality assurance mechanisms are documented. But at the same time, it is impossible to fully state that the EPs are student-oriented, due to the lack of a contingent for several years. During the examination, the accredited EPs did not reveal the active participation of teaching staff and students in research work and innovative projects. Mostly teachers participate in creative exhibitions and events. Analysis of the self-assessment report and statistics of the EP revealed the lack of activity of the teaching staff in the publication of scientific papers, articles and EML.

Strengths / best practice EP8D02108 Decorative Arts: not found.

Strengths/Best Practice EP 8D02102 Painting:

- The leadership of the EP ensured respect and attention to various groups of students and their needs, providing them with flexible learning paths;
- The ED defines the mechanisms to ensure the achievement of learning outcomes by each EP graduate and ensures the completeness of their formation;
- Assessors are proficient in modern methods for evaluating learning outcomes and regularly improve their skills in this area.

EEC recommendations on EP8D02108 Decorative arts and 8D02102 Painting:

1. The management of the accredited EPs to develop an action plan to attract teaching staff and students to research work, innovative projects until 09/01/2023.

2. The leadership of the Academy to develop an action plan for compliance with the teaching staff as supervisors of doctoral students and assist them in the preparation and publication of articles in international peer-reviewed scientific journals on 01.12.2022.

EEC conclusions by criteria:

According to the standard "student-centered learning, teaching and performance assessment" EP 8D02108 Decorative Arts 10 criteria are disclosed, of which: 10 are satisfactory.

According to the standard "student-centered learning, teaching and assessment" EP 8D02102 Painting disclosed 10 criteria, of which 3 have strong, 7 - satisfactory positions.

6.6. Standard "Students"

✓ *The university must demonstrate the policy of forming a contingent of students and ensure transparency, publicity of the procedures governing the life cycle of students (from admission to completion).*

✓ *The management of the EP should provide for special adaptation and support programs for newly enrolled and foreign students.*

✓ *The university must demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, including the existence and application of a mechanism for recognizing the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of additional, formal and non-formal education.*

✓ *The university should provide an opportunity for external and internal academic mobility of students, as well as assist them in obtaining external grants for study.*

✓ *The university should encourage students to self-education and development outside the main program (extracurricular activities).*

✓ *An important factor is the existence of a mechanism to support gifted students.*

✓ *The university must demonstrate cooperation with other educational organizations and national centers of the "European Network of National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information Centers" ENIC / NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications.*

✓ *The university must provide students with internship places, demonstrate the procedure facilitating the employment of graduates, maintaining contact with them.*

✓ *The university must demonstrate the procedure for issuing documents to graduates confirming the qualifications received, including the achieved learning outcomes.*

✓ *The management of the EP must demonstrate that graduates of the program have the skills that are in demand in the labor market and that these skills are really relevant.*

✓ *The management of the EP must demonstrate the existence of a mechanism for monitoring the employment and professional activities of graduates.*

✓ *An important factor is the existence of an active alumni association/association.*

Evidence

The expert group notes that the leadership of the Academy When forming the contingent of students is guided by the current legislation, the regulatory framework, the Model Rules for Admission to Training. The contingent of students is formed on the basis of the state order, the amount of which is determined by the authorized body, based on the real needs for specialists in the arts in cultural and art organizations and educational organizations that train creative workers and the application of the academy.

The draft plan for the admission of students for the next academic year is considered and discussed at meetings of departments, EMBF, AC and approved by order of the Rector of the Academy. Career guidance work is of a planned nature and includes informing students of OHPGE about KazNAA EP, its competitive advantages, and the demand for graduates in the labor market; holding advertising campaigns within the framework of Open Doors Days, field meetings with students of OHPGE; holding conferences, round tables, competitions and exhibitions at the Academy; placement of information in the media; timely correction of Internet information about the Academy on the official website of KazNAA.

In order to strengthen career guidance, reach a new level of public relations, the Academy's interaction with interested bodies and institutions, prompt study and forecasting of the need for specialists in the educational services market and further improve the image of KazNAA, the departments and OHPEO present the information necessary for future applicants in the section "

Applicants" on the KazNAA website. The faculties and the Department of Career Guidance, together with the Department of the Academy, develop promotional products and coordinate the activities of the faculties in working with potential applicants and employers. All conditions and requirements for the admission of doctoral students for study in EP 8D02108 Decorative Arts and 8D02102 Painting at the Academy are observed and performed on the basis of the Rules for Admission to Master's and Doctoral Studies. The statistics of the contingent of accredited EPs showed a low involvement of applicants in admission to these EPs (Table 2). When interviewing the leadership of the Academy, it was revealed that the main reason for the lack of a contingent is the low level of English proficiency.

The Academy controls the quality of mastering educational programs by students according to established criteria and ensures constant monitoring and improvement of the educational services provided, including developing and supporting the research activities of students. The main task of the research work of a doctoral student is the full possession of the skills of independent scientific, research, theoretical and experimental work. Scientific projects are organized parallel to the educational process.

Also, KazNAA, in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications, is guided in its activities by the principles and provisions of the "European Network of National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility" (ENIC / NARIC). Cooperation with the organization of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the MCS RK, the Center for the Bologna Process and Academic Mobility consists in the periodic exchange of certain information on the timing of institutional and specialized accreditation, guidelines for the development of EP based on ECTS, etc. Academic mobility of students is one of the important areas of international activity. The basis for the transfer of credits of the Academy is the Regulations on the system of transfer of credits for ECTS. The Academy regulates the activities of academic mobility of students with the following regulatory documents:

The Academy has concluded agreements with organizations, enterprises, institutions designated as practice bases for various periods (from one to five years), covering all EPs. There is an annual increase in bases of practice.

KazNAA has the necessary MTDB (classrooms, specialized classrooms, workshops) to organize the educational process for all EPs. The infrastructure of the OP "Painting" includes 8 specialized rooms and workshops, equipped with easels, staging materials, paintings. For Basic disciplines there are classrooms with interactive whiteboards. EP "Decorative Art" 8 specialized rooms and 4 production workshops. All conditions are created for the development and use of ICT by students, employees and teaching staff - 7 computer classes; 1 NITsPVO; Scientific and editorial department, video conference room; a small theater, a cinema hall and workshops for practical classes, which fully ensures the quality of scientific and educational processes. There are more than 100 computer equipment, which allows to provide each classroom with computer equipment. The accredited EPs have software: Windows 8.1, Windows 10, Office 2013, Office 2016, NOD32, Adobe full package, Corel Draw. The priority direction of activity of each teaching staff of KazNAA is customer orientation, the principles of which are based on relationship marketing. During the entire educational process, each student evaluates the activities of the teaching staff. Thus, feedback is provided between the teacher and students, the rating of each specialist is determined, which is based on relationship marketing. During the entire educational process, each student evaluates the activities of the teaching staff. Thus, feedback is provided between the teacher and students, the rating of each specialist is determined, which is based on relationship marketing. During the entire educational process, each student evaluates the activities of the teaching staff. Thus, feedback is provided between the teacher and students, the rating of each specialist is determined.

Analytical part

The experts noted that the policy of forming a contingent of students at the Academy is systemic and is carried out throughout the academic year. The admission procedure for students is

based on the principles of openness and transparency. *Nonetheless, on EP 8D02108 Decorative Arts and 8D02102 Painting, the policy of forming a contingent of students needs to be improved, it is necessary to develop and implement an effective mechanism for regularly informing all interested parties about the EP, the academic mobility program needs to be improved in terms of using online and distance learning opportunities.*

The Academy ensures the continuity of the levels of professional education in the "school-college-university" system, the levels of higher education ("bachelor's degree - master's degree - doctoral studies"); KazNAA controls the quality of mastering the EP by students according to the established criteria and ensures constant monitoring and improvement of the educational services provided; the Academy has created conditions for the education of students, the formation of their patriotic, spiritual and moral qualities for personal development; cooperation is actively carried out with city, regional, republican and international organizations involved in youth policy; at the proper level, provides students with the opportunity to undergo internships in the EP, concluding agreements with the heads of enterprises; all the necessary conditions are created in accordance with the established criteria,

At the same time, it is necessary: to diversify the forms and methods of attracting employers to the process of graduate employment; make the maximum amount of effort to provide graduates with employment and establish relationships with graduates; to improve the work on information support of the educational process, to provide students with the opportunity to communicate with each other through an Internet forum; to improve the work of monitoring the air pollution control system for all its types in the aggregate.

The analysis showed that the Management of the EP needs to consider the possibility of harmonizing the EP of the cluster with similar EPs of foreign and Kazakh universities in order to further expand the academic mobility of students and participation in grant programs. And also, consider the possibility of developing a mechanism for informing about the cooperation and interaction of graduates with the Academy.

T.K. Zhurgenov Kazakh National Academy of Arts has a modern innovative material and technical base that meets the requirements of sanitary standards and state general educational standards for the specialty being implemented. All available material and technical base contribute to the development of the creative process of students and teachers, classes are held in educational and specialized classrooms, workshops, reading rooms, computer classes, large and small assembly halls, conference rooms, viewing rooms, libraries.

The EEC revealed the readiness of the EP for implementation, since all quality assurance mechanisms are documented. Analyzing the "Students" standard, the members of the EEC came to the conclusion that the university did not sufficiently demonstrate the policy of forming a contingent of students in the Development Strategy.

Strengths/Best Practice in EP 8D02108 Decorative Arts, 8D02102 Painting:

-The management of the EP provides a strong material and technical base, an information resource, and human resources.

EEC recommendations on educational programs 8D02108 Decorative arts, 8D02102 Painting:

1. Before the start of the 2022-2023 academic year, the management of the EP should demonstrate the existence of a policy for the formation of a contingent of students in the context of the EP, ensure transparency and the publication of its procedures regulating the life cycle of students. The EEC recommends that by August 1, 2022, develop and implement an effective mechanism for regularly informing all interested parties about the EP, develop a road map for the formation of a contingent.

2. EP Guide before the start of the 2022-2023 academic year, it should provide the EP with a contingent, the opportunity for external and internal mobility of students of the EP, as well as the readiness to assist them in obtaining external grants for training.

Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:

According to the standard "Students" EP 8D02108 Decorative arts, 12 criteria are disclosed, of which: 1-strong, 9-satisfactory, 2-suggests improvements.

According to the standard "Students" EP 8D02102 Painting, 12 criteria are disclosed, of which 1 have strong, 10 satisfactory positions, 1 suggests improvement.

6.7. Standard "Teaching Staff"

✓ *The university must have an objective and transparent personnel policy in the context of the EP, including recruitment (including invited teaching staff), professional growth and development of staff, ensuring the professional competence of the entire staff.*

✓ *The university must demonstrate the compliance of the qualitative composition of the teaching staff with the established qualification requirements, the strategy of the university, and the goals of the EP.*

✓ *The leadership of the EP should demonstrate the change in the role of the teacher in connection with the transition to student-centered learning and teaching.*

✓ *The university should provide opportunities for career growth and professional development of teaching staff, including young teachers.*

✓ *The university should involve in teaching specialists from relevant industries with professional competencies that meet the requirements of the EP.*

▪ *The university must demonstrate the presence of a motivation mechanism for the professional and personal development of teaching staff.*

✓ *The university must demonstrate the widespread use of information and communication technologies and software in the educational process by the teaching staff (for example, on-line training, e-portfolio, MEPs, etc.).*

✓ *The university must demonstrate its focus on the development of academic mobility, attracting the best foreign and domestic teachers.*

✓ *The university must demonstrate the involvement of each teacher in promoting a culture of quality and academic honesty at the university, determine the contribution of teaching staff, including those invited, to achieving the goals of the EP.*

✓ *An important factor is the involvement of teaching staff in the development of the economy, education, science and culture of the region and the country.*

Evidence

The personnel policy of the academy is reflected in the Regulation approved by the decision of the Academic Council of the RSI "T. Zhurgenov KazNAA dated August 29, 2018 Protocol No. 1, and posted on the website of the Academy. The personnel policy has been developed in accordance with the Development Strategy of the RSI "T. Zhurgenov KazNAA presents the main directions and approaches of personnel management for the implementation of the mission and strategic goals. The system of hiring the teaching staff is inscribed in the general personnel policy of the Academy. Specialists are recruited in accordance with the rules for the competitive filling of positions of teaching staff and scientific workers of higher educational institutions (Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 17, 2012 No. 230 "On approval of the Rules for the competitive filling of positions of teaching staff and scientific workers of higher educational institutions").

The personnel policy of the Academy is objective and transparent. The recruitment of new employees, as well as the extension of the contract, is carried out on a competitive basis. The Academy has developed a unified certification system for teachers, which allows you to monitor the quality of teaching objectively and comprehensively.

The organizational procedure for optimizing the staff of the academy is as follows:

- the necessary and sufficient quantitative composition of units is determined based on the functional tasks and the amount of work performed. The basis for forecasting the need for personnel is the development strategy of the Academy, the system of long-term goals, the situation on the regional labor market and the results of personnel monitoring.

- determination of qualification requirements for specific positions and jobs.

- implementation of the search and selection of personnel for vacant positions in accordance with the requirements for the level of qualification and professional competence of candidates, for their personal, professionally important psychological and social qualities;
- selection for vacant positions of teaching staff is carried out on the basis of a competition conducted on the basis of the openness of the conditions for its implementation and the objectivity of the selection of results;
- when hiring employees, the requirements of the Labor Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan are observed and a probationary period is established.

While reviewing the documents and during the interviews, the experts revealed that the Academy has a principle of a democratic approach to personnel management. The management of the Academy is open and accessible to employees and teaching staff. All employees of the working order could resolve professional and personal issues with the leadership of the academy. In addition, the rector, vice-rectors, heads of structural divisions have visiting hours. There is a transparency of personnel procedures, which is ensured by holding a competition for filling positions of teaching staff and is carried out based on a personnel policy regulated by the Labor Legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The Academy has established a competition commission that determines the forms, procedures, and deadlines for holding a competition for filling vacant positions. The result of the work of the Commission is the conclusion of employment contracts with applicants who have passed the competitive selection. The main reasons for the dismissal of teaching staff are: the expiration of the employment contract and the employee's initiative. The qualifications of the teaching staff of KazNAA, their quantitative composition correspond to the areas of training of doctoral students, meet the qualification requirements for educational activities and testify to the staffing of the educational activities of the Academy. In addition to teaching staff with scientific degrees, for which the main place of work is KazNAA, the departments attract scientists-professors from the top educational institutions of the Republic of Kazakhstan. In the course of familiarization with the documents, the quantitative and qualitative composition of the teaching staff was established. The positions of the teaching staff correspond to the qualification characteristics of scientific and pedagogical workers in accordance with the Job Competences.

Table - Scientific publications of the teaching staff of the department "Decorative Art"

Publications	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021
1. Publications in journals: - with a non-zero impact factor, etc. <i>including:</i>	2	3	2	1	2
WoS, Scopus	1	1	2	1	2
RSCI	1	2	-	-	
3. Patents, AU	-	1	2	2	5
4. Textbooks, teaching aids / including in English.	-- / --	-- / --	4 --	-- / --	2 / --
5. Monographs / including in English.	-- / --	-- / --	-- / --	1 / --	1 / --

Table - Scientific publications of the teaching staff of the department "Fine Art"

Publications	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021
1. Publications in journals: - with a non-zero impact factor, etc. <i>including:</i>	1	4	2	3	2
WoS, Scopus	1	2	-	2	1
RSCI	*	2	2	1	1
3. Patents, AU	1	1	-	11	1

4. Textbooks, teaching aids / including in English.	- / -	1 / -	1 / -	1 / -	1 / -
5. Monographs / including in English.	- / -	1 / -	- / -	- / -	- / -

The degree of EP 8D02108 Decorative Arts, 8D02102 Painting is 36.4% and 40%, respectively. All teachers of educational programs have basic education and carry out pedagogical activities according to an individual plan.

And also the EEC confirms that the Management of KazNAA always tries to stimulate the research activities of the teaching staff. So, for example, according to the results of the teaching staff rating, funds are allocated for rewarding the research activities of teachers, which was revealed during interviews. The teaching staff undergoes advanced training at least once every 5 years, which involves the study of programs for an accredited EP. Upon completion of advanced training, documents confirming the training (certificates) are submitted to the department, and a report on the passage of the SIW, including the courses held at KazNAA, is heard at the UMBF.

The leadership of the Academy stimulates the professional and personal development of all teaching staff. Every year, upon granting the next paid leave, the teaching staff is paid a health improvement allowance in the amount of one monthly salary. Material assistance is allocated, benefits are provided for medical care in the dispensary of the Republic of Kazakhstan, etc.

During the work of the EEC, it was revealed that the management of accredited EPs is working to support young teachers. In T. Zhurgenov KazNAA Department of Decorative and Applied Arts as part of the teaching staff - young teachers who graduated from the master's program and, in addition to teaching, actively participate in creative exhibitions not only in Kazakhstan. For example: - from October 6 to November 6, 2016, in the hall of the Design Museum in Yekaterinburg, an international exhibition conference and a group exhibition were held as part of the festival "Turkic Images of Eurasia" together with Mukanov Malik Zhamkhan Aidarlar, Baurzhan Doszhanov, teacher of the Department of Arts and Crafts, as part of the first Ural festival of arts and crafts, which is held every three years.

During the reporting period, teachers of the departments of the Faculty of Painting, Sculpture and Design published a number of educational and methodological literature, including those with ISBN.

Analytical part

The EEC notes that the indicators for the qualitative and quantitative composition of the teaching staff confirm the availability of human resources necessary for the implementation of the accredited EP and the corresponding qualification requirements for licensing educational activities. Experts have determined that teachers and staff are focused on performance in their work, which contributes to the achievement of high-performance results for each employee and the university as a whole.

But ensuring that the teaching staff is informed about the possibility of providing academic mobility and professional development is not enough. In this regard, the management of accredited EPs needs to increase the level of academic mobility of teaching staff and research work, as well as to intensify scientific activity. There is an insufficient activity of teaching staff in scientific activities, due to the specifics of the specialty.

The analysis showed that the personnel policy ensures that the implemented educational programs are staffed with qualified specialists and that it complies with the strategy of the university and the specifics of the EP. The university provides the teaching staff of the EP with opportunities for career growth and professional development. At the same time, according to the results of an anonymous survey of the teaching staff, the innovative activities of teaching staff are encouraged: very good - 69.2%, good - 30.8%, bad - 0%. But at the same time, during interviews, teaching staff do not note the use of innovative teaching methods in training.

EEC members note that the availability of academic mobility of teaching staff within the framework of the EP will improve the quality of educational services provided, provide an opportunity for young teachers to gain scientific experience in leading foreign universities and universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan. It is necessary to develop double-diploma education, joint educational programs for accredited EPs.

Strengths/best practice in EP 8D02108 Decorative Arts:

-The management of the EP demonstrates the compliance of the personnel potential of the teaching staff with the specifics of the EP.

Strengths / best practice in EP 8D02102 Painting:

- The leadership of the EP demonstrated the motivation for the professional and personal development of EP teachers;

-EP Guidehas an objective and transparent personnel policy, including in the context of EP, including recruitment, professional growth and development of personnel, ensuring the professional competence of the entire staff.

-The management of the EP demonstrates the compliance of the personnel potential of the teaching staff with the specifics of the EP;

- The leadership of the EP widely involves relevant practitioners in teaching.

EEC recommendations on educational programs of the EP8D02108 Decorative arts,8D02102 Painting:

1.The management of the EP to organize training activities for the teaching staff on the use of the mechanisms available at the university for academic mobility within the framework of the EP, attracting the best foreign and domestic teachers by January 1, 2023.

2.The management of the EP should ensure the improvement of favorable working conditions for its employees.

EEC conclusionsaccording to the criteria for educational programs:

According to the standard "Teaching Staff" for EP 8D02108 Decorative Arts, 9 criteria were disclosed, 1 - strong, 7 - satisfactory: 1 - suggesting improvement.

According to the standard "Teaching staff" according to EP 8D02102 Painting disclosed 9 criteria, of which 4 have strong, 5 satisfactory positions.

6.8. Standard "Educational resources and student support systems"

✓ The university must guarantee the compliance of the infrastructure, educational resources, including material and technical, with the goals of the educational program.

✓ The management of the EP must demonstrate the sufficiency of classrooms, laboratories and other facilities equipped with modern equipment to ensure the achievement of the objectives of the EP.

✓ The university must demonstrate the compliance of information resources with the needs of the university and the EPs being implemented, including in the following areas:

technological support for students and teaching staff in accordance with educational programs (for example, online learning, modeling, databases, data analysis programs);

library resources, including a fund of educational, methodical and scientific literature on general education, basic and major disciplines on paper and electronic media, periodicals, access to scientific databases.

examination of the results of research, final works, dissertations for plagiarism.

access to educational Internet resources;

functioning of WI-FI in its territory.

✓ The university must demonstrate that it creates conditions for conducting scientific research, integrating science and education, publishing the results of research work of teaching staff, staff and students.

✓ The university should strive to ensure that the educational equipment and software used for the development of educational programs are similar to those used in the relevant sectors of the economy.

✓ The management of the EP should demonstrate the existence of procedures for supporting various groups of students, including information and counseling.

✓ The management of the EP should show the existence of conditions for the advancement of the student along an individual educational trajectory.

- ✓ *The university must take into account the needs of different groups of students (adults, working, foreign students, as well as students with special educational needs).*
- ✓ *The university must ensure that the infrastructure meets the safety requirements.*

Evidence

The Commission of the EEC generally notes that the management of the EP creates favorable conditions in the framework of providing the necessary basis for the implementation of the educational process within the framework of accredited programs, including the material, technical and information resources used in the educational process, which are sufficient and meet the requirements established for the main activity, the development strategy of the OHPGE and the goals of the EP, which contributes to the formation of the professional competence of students based on their individual needs and capabilities: 1. 2 own educational buildings; 2. A hostel that fully satisfies the need for living in a hostel for non-residents and students; 3. Catering facility - two canteens that meet the need for food for students, teaching staff and employees.

The experts noted the involvement of leading experts in the field of fine and decorative arts to work at the EP Decorative Arts Regular professional development of teaching staff through the FPC, advanced training courses, participation in master classes, holding and visiting exhibitions of prominent figures of modern culture. Active participation of teaching staff in international creative and research projects

There is a cinema hall equipped with modern equipment for scientific (forums, conferences) and educational events. Maly theatre, museum; A sufficient amount of computer equipment, TTT and software; AIS "PLATONUS" to automate the management of the educational process and the implementation of DOT; AIS "MOODLE" for the organization of the educational process; Book fund - 256,983 items. library fund of educational and scientific literature in the format of printed and electronic publications, providing 100% of the disciplines of educational programs, including those published in the languages of instruction. The educational buildings and equipment of the academy comply with the current sanitary rules, norms and fire safety requirements. Heating, electricity, cold and hot water supply and sewerage in all buildings of the academy are centralized. The sanitary condition of the premises is strictly observed. Particular attention is paid to the aesthetic design of existing buildings, which instills in students a high sense of taste, creativity, and patriotism for their academy.

Sufficiently strong material and technical equipment of the academy, practice bases are the basis for further developed infrastructure of educational and scientific activities of the university. The main goal of the academy is a developed infrastructure and material and technical base for educational and scientific activities. The main objectives of the academy are: the creation of a modern creative, educational and laboratory base, the development of multimedia and distance learning technologies; development of social infrastructure; digitalization and informatization of education and scientific research. The creation of a modern creative, scientific, educational and laboratory base provides for the allocation of funds for the creation of new laboratories, the creation of halls for videoconferencing, recording video lectures, equipping classrooms and laboratories with modern equipment and computer technology with an Internet connection, equipping classrooms with modern educational facilities (projectors, interactive whiteboards, scanners, printers, audio and video equipment, multimedia tools), equipping workshops, etc. Material and technical base accredited EPs include modern classrooms equipped with multimedia projectors, computers and equipment: ovens, potter's wheels, looms, rollers, burners, polishers, sewing machines, etc. Also, the classrooms of the departments are equipped with stands and visual teaching aids. In each workshop, there are work plans, passports, instructions, a safety magazine, a memo and instructions on fire safety measures. Each workshop is equipped with fire extinguishing equipment: fire extinguishers, sandboxes. All classrooms and workshops are themed. The following audiences function at the department: painting and composition workshops, drawing workshops, artistic wood processing workshops, textile art processing workshops, metal art processing workshops, a sculpture workshop, a ceramic workshop with a firing kiln, computer

classes with specialized licensed programs, Museum of T. Zhurgenov KazNAA (where exhibitions of creative works of teaching staff and students are held), canteens, etc.

In general, the material, technical, informational and library resources used to organize the process of education and upbringing are sufficient to fulfill the stated mission, goals and objectives and meet the requirements of ongoing educational programs.

Analytical part

As a result of visiting the facilities of the material base with representatives of the relevant services of the Academy, the members of the EEC note that the university has the necessary educational and material assets to ensure the educational process of accredited educational programs. The buildings and structures of the Academy comply with the current sanitary standards and fire safety requirements.

The experts also revealed that the site of T. Zhurgenov KazNAA educational portal, provide access via the Internet: to the working curricula of the EP; to test tasks in all studied disciplines; to educational videos; to the electronic catalog of the library. The dynamics of development of material and technical resources is positive. All written works must be checked for borrowings according to the anti-plagiarism system of the Academy. But at the same time, doctoral students conduct an anti-plagiarism check at the National Center for Science and Technology.

Instead, take steps to improve qualityfunctioning of WI-FI on the territory of the educational organization.

*EP 8D02102 Painting:*Based on the results of a visual on-line inspection of the facilities of the material base, the EEC notes that to ensure the educational process of the accredited EP, the Academy has the necessary educational and material resources and infrastructure. Classrooms and workshops, the equipment placed in them correspond to the objectives of the EP and create acceptable conditions for learning. The university conducts an assessment of the quality of material, technical and information resources, monitoring is carried out.

Strengths / best practice in EP 8D02108 Decorative Arts and EP 8D02102 Painting:

- The management demonstrated the provision of educational equipment and software similar to those used in the respective industries.
- has library resources, including a fund of educational, methodical and scientific literature on general education, basic and major disciplines on paper and electronic media, periodicals, access to scientific databases.

EEC recommendations:

By the beginning of the 2022-2023 academic year, the university management is recommended to take measures to improve the qualityfunctioning of Wi-Fi on the territory of the educational organization.

Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria:

According to the standardEducational Resources and Student Support Systems” EP 8D02108 Decorative Arts disclosed 9 criteria, of which: 9 are satisfactory.

According to the standardEducational resources and student support systems» OP 8D02102 Painting disclosed 9 criteria, of which 2 have strong, 7 satisfactory positions.

6.9. Public Information Standard

- ✓ *The university guarantees that the published information is accurate, objective, up-to-date and reflects all areas of the university's activities within the framework of the educational program.*
- ✓ *Informing the public should include support and explanation of national programs for the development of the country and the system of higher and postgraduate education.*
- ✓ *The university management should use a variety of ways to disseminate information (including the media, web resources, information networks, etc.) to inform the general public and interested parties.*
- ✓ *Information about the educational program is objective, up-to-date and should include:*
- ✓ *the purpose and planned results of the EP, the qualifications to be awarded;*

- ✓ *information and the system for assessing the educational achievements of students;*
- ✓ *information about academic mobility programs and other forms of cooperation with partner universities, employers;*
- ✓ *information about the opportunities for the development of personal and professional competencies of students and employment;*
- ✓ *data reflecting the positioning of the EP in the market of educational services (at the regional, national, international levels).*
- ✓ *An important factor is the publication on open resources of reliable information about teaching staff, in the context of personalities.*
- ✓ *The university must publish audited financial statements for the EP on its own web resource.*
- ✓ *The university must post information and links to external resources based on the results of external evaluation procedures.*
- ✓ *An important factor is the placement of information about cooperation and interaction with partners, including scientific / consulting organizations, business partners, social partners and educational organizations.*

Evidence

During the visit, EEC experts studied materials and documents, as well as information posted on the official website of the Academy, publications of accounts in social networks and the media. The main resource for informing the public about the activities of the university is the website (<https://kaznai.kz/>). The site provides the necessary amount of information about the Academy, structural divisions, educational programs and news; up-to-date information about upcoming events and other events held by the Academy.

A student television studio operates at the academy, which is an important educational platform for demonstrating the ability of young students to be creative (cameraman, media journalist, screenwriter, director, etc.).

On the website of the Academy, a financing plan for a state institution is available, as well as information about the department, about the composition of the teaching staff. But at the same time, the site *there is no information about the English version and the version for the visually impaired. Including no sections of the EP, resumes of teaching staff, photos of teachers. There is no information about EP and teaching staff in the doctoral studies section. In the doctoral section, some of the documents (list of documents for admission, application for entrance exams, schedules of exams, appeals and consultations) are only in Russian, the order for admission is only in Kazakh.*

Information about the specialty that graduates the department is regularly updated, which contains information about the demand for specialists, the mission and strategic line of the department, the composition of the teaching staff, all types of activities of the department, etc.

Informing the public about the PA and EP is adequate and objective. The information is extensive (personnel issues, personal information about the teaching staff, international cooperation, creative and scientific activity of the teaching staff and students, social activities) and is published in various media - social networks, on the academy website, in magazines and newspapers, in the form of articles in scientific indexed journals (domestic and foreign), on television as part of television programs on Kazakhstani TV channels and on Youtube and Facebook; The Instagram channel of the Department of Fine Arts @korkemsyret_kafedrasy and the Department of Decorative Arts @kaznai_dekorative are actively functioning, which posts information on entrance exams, ongoing events, publishes creative projects, etc.

Analytical part

The site <https://kaznai.kz/> contains the main documentation of the university, reflects information of a scientific, educational and creative nature. The site is distinguished by openness and a high level of information resources. There is a great public interest in creative processes and personalities. The information is up-to-date and objective and is provided in a variety of ways.

Strengths / best practice EP8D02108 Decorative arts»:not found.

Strengths / best practice in EP 8D02102 Painting:

- the existence of a variety of ways to disseminate information, including the media, information networks to inform the general public and interested parties.
- The EP management published reliable, objective, up-to-date information about the educational program and its specifics, including approaches of teaching, learning, as well as the system (procedures, methods and forms) of assessment.

EEC recommendations for EP8D02108 Decorative arts and OP 8D02102 Painting:

Post annually on the official website of the university adequate and objective information on the teaching staff of the EP before 01/01/2023.

EEC conclusions by criteria:

According to the standard "Informing the public" EP 8D02108 Decorative art disclosed 10 criteria, of which: 8 are satisfactory, 2 require improvement.

According to the standard "Informing the public" EP 8D02102 Painting disclosed 10 criteria, of which 2 have strong, 8 satisfactory positions.

(VIII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICE FOR EACH STANDARD

Standard "Educational program management»

The proof of the openness and accessibility of the EP for students, teaching staff, employers and other interested parties is demonstrated.

Information Management and Reporting Standard

Availability of mechanisms for involving students, employees and teaching staff in the processes of collecting and analyzing information, as well as making decisions based on them.

Standard "Development and approval of educational programs"

according to OP 8D02108 Decorative arts not found.

on OP 8D02102 Painting:

the management of the EP determined the influence of disciplines and professional practices on the formation of learning outcomes;

- the management of the EP ensured that the content of the EP complied with the established goals, including the intended learning outcomes.

Standard "Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of educational programs"

Not identified.

Student-Centered Learning, Teaching and Assessment Standard

Not identified.

according to EP 8D02102 Painting:

The leadership of the EP ensured respect and attention to the various groups of students and their needs, providing them with flexible learning paths;

- The EI defines the mechanisms to ensure the achievement of learning outcomes by each EP graduate and ensures the completeness of their formation;

- Assessors are proficient in modern methods for evaluating learning outcomes and regularly improve their skills in this area.

Standard "Students"

The management of the EP provides a strong material and technical, information resource, personnel potential.

Standard "Teaching Staff"

according to EP 8D02108 - Decorative arts":

The management of the EP demonstrates the compliance of the personnel potential of the teaching staff with the specifics of the EP.

according to EP 8D02102 Painting:

The leadership of the EP demonstrated the motivation for the professional and personal development of EP teachers;

The management of the EP has an objective and transparent personnel policy, including in the context of the EP, including recruitment, professional growth and development of personnel, ensuring the professional competence of the entire staff.

The management of the EP demonstrates the compliance of the personnel potential of the teaching staff with the specifics of the EP;

The leadership of the EP widely engages relevant practitioners in teaching.

Standard "Educational resources and student support systems"

The management demonstrated the provision of educational equipment and software similar to those used in the respective industries.

It has library resources, including a fund of educational, methodical and scientific literature on general education, basic and major disciplines on paper and electronic media, periodicals, access to scientific databases.

Public Information Standard

Availability of a variety of ways to disseminate information, including the media, information networks to inform the general public and stakeholders.

The management of the EP published reliable, objective, up-to-date information about the educational program and its specifics, including the approaches of teaching, learning, as well as the system (procedures, methods and forms) of assessment.

(IX) OVERVIEW RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVING QUALITY

Standard "Educational program management»

1. The management of the accredited EPs should include in the EP development plan a section describing possible risks in the implementation of the accredited EPs, indicating the names of risks, possible consequences, a description of the mechanisms and risk management measures by September 1, 2022.

2. The management of accredited EPs to develop mechanisms for monitoring the effectiveness of EP development, innovation management within the EP, including the analysis and implementation of innovative proposals until 01.01.2023.

Information Management and Reporting Standard

1. The leadership of the academy should regularly update the site, ensuring convenient navigation and access to information, including information about the activities of accredited EPs and in the declared three languages;

2. The leadership of the academy should provide for an assessment of the effectiveness and efficiency of activities, including in the context of EP;

3. The leadership of the academy should provide mechanisms for collecting and analyzing information within the framework of the EP, taking into account key performance indicators until 09/01/2022;

4. The management of accredited EPs should include in the EP development plan a section describing measures to increase the dynamics of the contingent studying before 1.09.2022.

5. The management of the accredited EPs should demonstrate the determination of the procedure and ensuring the protection of information, including the identification of persons responsible for the reliability and timeliness of the analysis of information and the provision of data by the beginning of 2023.

Standard "Development and approval of educational programs"

1. The management of accredited EPs, when developing models of graduates, to ensure a competency-based approach in accordance with the levels of the International Standard Classification of Education until 01.01.2023;

2. The management of the accredited EPs to develop an action plan to harmonize the content of the EP with similar EPs of domestic and foreign universities in order to form and implement joint EPs on 01.12.2022.

Standard "Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of educational programs"

1. The management of accredited EPs should regularly ensure the publication of the results of the changes made on the website of the academy, as well as in various media about any planned or undertaken actions related to the implementation of the EP.

Student-Centered Learning, Teaching and Assessment Standard

1. The management of the accredited EPs to develop an action plan to attract teaching staff and students to research work, innovative projects until 09/01/2023.

2. The leadership of the Academy to develop an action plan for compliance with the teaching staff as supervisors of doctoral students and assist them in the preparation and publication of articles in international peer-reviewed scientific journals on 01.12.2022.

Standard "Students"

1. Before the beginning of the 2022-2023 academic year, the management of the EP should demonstrate the existence of a policy for the formation of a contingent of students in the context of the EP, ensure transparency and publicity of its procedures governing the life cycle of students. The EEC recommends that by August 1, 2022, develop and implement an effective mechanism for regularly informing all interested parties about the EP, develop a road map for the formation of a contingent.

2. Before the beginning of the 2022-2023 academic year, the management of the EP should provide the EP with a contingent, the possibility for external and internal mobility of students of the EP, as well as the readiness to assist them in obtaining external grants for training.

Standard "Teaching Staff"

1. The management of the EP to organize training events for the teaching staff on using the mechanisms available at the university for academic mobility within the framework of the EP, attracting the best foreign and domestic teachers by January 1, 2023.

2. The management of the EP must ensure the improvement of favorable working conditions for its employees.

Standard "Educational resources and student support systems"

1. By the beginning of the 2022-2023 academic year, the university administration is recommended to take measures to improve the quality of WI-FI functioning on the territory of the educational organization.

Public Information Standard

1. Annually post on the official website of the university adequate and objective information about the teaching staff of the EP until 01/01/2023.

(X) OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION

There are no recommendations of the EEC related to the development of the organization of education, but not related to measures to improve the quality and compliance with the IAAR standards for the evaluated EP.

Appendix 1. Evaluation table "PARAMETERS OF THE SPECIALIZED PROFILE (EX-ANTE)"

Conclusion of the external expert commission for quality assessment

educational program 8D02108 - *Decorative arts*

RGO "T.K.Zhurgenov Kazakh National Academy" MCS

No • p \\ p	No. n\n	Criteria for evaluation	Position of the educational organization			
			strong	Satisfactory	Assumes implementation	Unsatisfactory
Standard "Educational program management»						
1	1.	The organization of higher and (or) postgraduate education must have a published quality assurance policy that reflects the relationship between research, teaching and learning		+		
2	2.	The organization of higher and (or) postgraduate education must demonstrate the development of a culture of quality assurance, including in the context of EP		+		
3	3.	Commitment to quality assurance should apply to any activity performed by contractors and partners (outsourcing), including the implementation of joint/double-degree education and academic mobility		+		
4	4.	The EP management demonstrates transparency in the development of the EP development plan, containing the start dates for implementation, based on an analysis of its functioning, the actual positioning of the EP and the focus of its activities on meeting the needs of the state, employers, students and other stakeholders		+		
5	5.	The EP management demonstrates the existence of mechanisms for the formation and regular revision of the EP development plan and monitoring its implementation, assessing the achievement of learning goals, meeting the needs of students, employers and society, making decisions aimed at continuous improvement of the EP		+		
6	6.	The management of the EP should involve representatives of stakeholder groups, including employers, students and teaching staff in the formation of a development plan for the EP		+		

7	7.	The management of the EP must demonstrate the individuality and uniqueness of the EP development plan, its consistency with national priorities and the development strategy of the organization of higher and (or) postgraduate education		+		
8	8.	The organization of higher and (or) postgraduate education must demonstrate a clear definition of those responsible for business processes within the framework of the EP, an unambiguous distribution of staff duties, and delimitation of the functions of collegial bodies		+		
9	9.	The management of the EP must provide evidence of the transparency of the educational program management system		+		
10	10.	The management of the EP must demonstrate the existence of an internal quality assurance system for the EP, including its design, management and monitoring, their improvement, decision-making based on facts		+		
11	11.	The management of the EP must carry out risk management, including within the framework of the EP undergoing primary accreditation, and also demonstrate a system of measures aimed at reducing the degree of risk		+		
12	12.	The management of the EP should ensure the participation of representatives of employers, teaching staff, students and other interested parties in the collegiate management bodies of the educational program, as well as their representativeness in making decisions on the management of the educational program		+		
13	13.	The EI must demonstrate innovation management within the EP, including the analysis and implementation of innovative proposals		+		
14	14.	The management of the EP must demonstrate evidence of readiness for openness and accessibility for students, teaching staff, employers and other interested parties	+			
15	15.	The management of the EP must be trained in education management programs		+		
Total by standard			1	14	0	0
Information Management and Reporting Standard						
16	1.	The EI must demonstrate the existence of a system for collecting, analyzing and managing information based on the use of modern information and communication technologies and software tools and that it uses a variety of methods to collect and analyze information in the context of the EP		+		

17	2.	The management of the EP must demonstrate the existence of a mechanism for the systematic use of processed, adequate information to improve the internal quality assurance system		+		
18	3.	The management of the EP must demonstrate fact-based decision making		+		
19	4.	Within the framework of the EP, a system of regular reporting should be provided, reflecting all levels of the structure, including an assessment of the effectiveness and efficiency of the activities of departments and departments, scientific research		+		
20	5.	The EI should establish the frequency, forms and methods for assessing the management of the EP, the activities of collegial bodies and structural divisions, top management, and the implementation of scientific projects		+		
21	6.	The EI must demonstrate the determination of the procedure for and ensuring the protection of information, including the identification of persons responsible for the reliability and timeliness of the analysis of information and the provision of data			+	
22	7.	An important factor is the availability of mechanisms for involving students, employees and teaching staff in the processes of collecting and analyzing information, as well as making decisions based on them.	+			
23	8.	The management of the EP must demonstrate the existence of a mechanism for communication with students, employees and other stakeholders, as well as mechanisms for resolving conflicts		+		
24	9.	EI must demonstrate the availability of mechanisms for measuring the degree of satisfaction with the needs of teaching staff, staff and students within the framework of the EP		+		
25	10.	The EI should provide for an assessment of the effectiveness and efficiency of activities, including in the context of the EP		+		
		<i>The information expected to be collected and analyzed within the framework of the EP should take into account:</i>				
26	11.	key performance indicators		+		
27	12.	the dynamics of the contingent of students in the context of forms and types			+	

28	13.	academic performance, student achievement and dropout		+		
29	14.	satisfaction of students with the implementation of the EP and the quality of education at the university		+		
30	15.	availability of educational resources and support systems for students		+		
31	16.	The EI must confirm the implementation of the procedures for processing personal data of students, employees and teaching staff on the basis of their documented consent		+		
Total by standard			1	13	2	0
Standard "Development and approval of the educational program"						
32	1.	The EI must define and document the procedures for developing the EP and their approval at the institutional level.		+		
33	2.	The management of the EP should ensure that the content of the EP complies with the established goals, including the intended learning outcomes.	+			
34	3.	The management of the EP must demonstrate the existence of mechanisms for reviewing the content and structure of the EP, taking into account changes in the labor market, the requirements of employers and the social demand of society		+		
35	4.	The management of the EP should ensure the availability of developed models of the EP graduate that describe the learning outcomes and personal qualities			+	
36	5.	The management of the EP must demonstrate the conduct of external reviews of the content of the EP and the planned results of its implementation		+		
37	6.	The qualification awarded upon completion of the EP must be clearly defined and correspond to a certain level of the NSC and QF-EHEA		+		
38	7.	The EP management should determine the influence of disciplines and professional practices on the formation of learning outcomes	+			
39	8.	An important factor is the possibility of preparing students for professional certification				
40	9.	The management of the EP must provide evidence of the participation of students, teaching staff and other interested parties in the development of the EP, ensuring its quality		+		

41	10.	The management of the EP should ensure that the content of the academic disciplines and the planned results correspond to the level of education (bachelor's, master's, doctoral studies)		+		
42	11.	The structure of the EP should provide for various types of activities that ensure that students achieve the planned learning outcomes		+		
43	12.	An important factor is the correspondence between the content of the EP and the learning outcomes of the EP implemented by organizations of higher and (or) postgraduate education in the EHEA		+		
Total by standard			2	8	1	0
Standard "Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of educational programs"						
44	1.	The EI should determine the mechanisms for monitoring and periodically evaluating the EP to ensure the achievement of the goal and meeting the needs of students, society, and show the focus of the mechanisms on the continuous improvement of the EP		+		
		<i>Monitoring and periodic evaluation of the EP should include:</i>				
45	2.	the content of the program in the light of the latest achievements of science in a particular discipline to ensure the relevance of the discipline taught		+		
46	3.	changing needs of society and the professional environment		+		
47	4.	workload, performance and graduation of students		+		
48	5.	effectiveness of student assessment procedures		+		
49	6.	expectations, needs and satisfaction of students with EP training		+		
50	7.	educational environment and support services, and their compliance with the objectives of the EP		+		
51	8.	The management of the EP must demonstrate a systematic approach in monitoring and periodically assessing the quality of the EP		+		
52	9.	The EI, the management of the EP should determine a mechanism for informing all interested parties about any planned or taken actions in relation to the EP		+		

53	10.	All changes made to the EP must be published		+		
Total by standard			0	10	0	0
Student-Centered Learning, Teaching and Assessment Standard						
54	1.	The management of the EP should ensure respect and attention to various groups of students and their needs, provide them with flexible learning paths	+			
55	2.	The management of the EP should provide for the use of various forms and methods of teaching and learning		+		
56	3.	An important factor is the presence of own research in the field of teaching methods of academic disciplines of the EP		+		
57	4.	The management of the EP must demonstrate the existence of feedback mechanisms for the use of various teaching methods and the assessment of learning outcomes		+		
58	5.	The management of the EP must demonstrate the existence of mechanisms to support the autonomy of students with simultaneous guidance and assistance from the teacher		+		
59	6.	The management of the EP must demonstrate the existence of a procedure for responding to complaints from students		+		
60	7.	The EI must ensure the consistency, transparency and objectivity of the mechanism for evaluating learning outcomes for each SP, including appeal		+		
61	8.	The EI must ensure that the procedures for assessing the learning outcomes of students of the EP correspond to the planned results and goals of the program, the publication of criteria and assessment methods in advance		+		
62	9.	The EI should define the mechanisms to ensure the achievement of learning outcomes by each EP graduate and ensure the completeness of their formation.	+			
63	10.	Assessors must be familiar with modern methods for assessing learning outcomes and regularly improve their skills in this area.	+			
Total by standard			3	7	0	0
Standard "Students»						
64	1.	The EI must demonstrate the existence of a policy for the formation of a contingent of students in the context of the EP,			+	

		ensure transparency and publicity of its procedures governing the life cycle of students (from admission to completion)				
		<i>The management of the EP should determine the procedure for the formation of a contingent of students based on:</i>				
65	1.	minimum requirements for applicants		+		
66	2.	maximum group size during seminars, practical, laboratory and studio classes		+		
67	3.	predicting the number of government grants		+		
68	4.	analysis of available material and technical, information resources, human resources		+		
69	5.	analysis of potential social conditions for students, incl. provision of places in the hostel		+		
70	6.	The management of the EP must demonstrate readiness to conduct special adaptation and support programs for newly enrolled and foreign students		+		
71	7.	The EI must demonstrate the compliance of its actions with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, the existence of a mechanism for recognizing the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of additional, formal and non-formal learning		+		
72	8.	The EI should cooperate with other educational organizations and national centers of the "European Network of National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information Centers" ENIC / NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications		+		
73	9.	The EI should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of students of the EP, as well as readiness to assist them in obtaining external grants for training		+		
74	10.	The management of the EP must demonstrate readiness to provide students with internship places, promote the employment of graduates, and maintain contact with them	+			
75	11.	The EI should provide for the possibility of providing graduates of the EP with documents confirming the qualifications received, including the achieved learning outcomes, as well as the context, content and status of the education received and evidence of its completion.		+		

Total by standard			1	10	1	0
Standard "Teaching staff»						
76	1.	The EI must have an objective and transparent personnel policy, including in the context of the EP, including recruitment, professional growth and development of personnel, ensuring the professional competence of the entire staff	+			
77	1.	The EI must demonstrate the compliance of the staff potential of the teaching staff with the specifics of the EP	+			
78	2.	The management of the EP must demonstrate awareness of responsibility for its employees and provide favorable working conditions for them		+		
79	3.	The management of the EP should demonstrate the change in the role of the teacher in connection with the transition to student-centered learning		+		
80	4.	The EI must determine the contribution of the teaching staff of the EP to the implementation of the development strategy of the EI, and other strategic documents		+		
81	5.	The EI should provide opportunities for career growth and professional development of the teaching staff of the EP	+			
82	6.	The management of the EP must demonstrate readiness to involve practitioners in the relevant sectors of the economy in teaching	+			
83	7.	The EI must demonstrate the motivation for the professional and personal development of EP teachers, including encouragement for the integration of scientific activities and education, the use of innovative teaching methods		+		
84	8.	An important factor is the readiness to develop academic mobility within the framework of the EP, to attract the best foreign and domestic teachers		+		
Total by standard			4	5	0	0
Standard "Educational resources and student support systems"						
85	1.	The EI must guarantee a sufficient number of educational resources and student support services to ensure the achievement of the goal of the EP		+		
86	2.	The EI must demonstrate the sufficiency of material and technical resources and infrastructure, taking into account the		+		

		needs of various groups of students in the context of the EP (adults, working, foreign students, as well as students with disabilities)				
87	3.	The management of the EP must demonstrate the existence of procedures for supporting various groups of students, including information and counseling		+		
		<i>The EP management must demonstrate the compliance of information resources with the specifics of the EP, including:</i>				
88	four .	technological support for students and teaching staff (for example, online learning, modeling, databases, data analysis programs)		+		
89	5.	library resources, including a fund of educational, methodical and scientific literature on general education, basic and major disciplines on paper and electronic media, periodicals, access to scientific databases		+		
90	6.	examination of the results of research, graduation works, dissertations for plagiarism	+			
91	7.	access to educational Internet resources		+		
92	eigh t.	functioning of WI-FI on the territory of the educational organization		+		
93	9.	The EI demonstrates the planning of providing the EP with educational equipment and software similar to those used in the relevant sectors of the economy	+			
Total by standard			2	7	0	0
Public Information Standard						
		<i>The EI must publish reliable, objective, up-to-date information about the educational program and its specifics, which should include:</i>				
94	1.	expected learning outcomes of the implemented educational program		+		
95	2.	qualification and (or) qualification that will be awarded upon completion of the educational program		+		
96	3.	approaches to teaching, learning, as well as a system (procedures, methods and forms) of assessment	+			
97	4.	information about passing scores and learning opportunities provided to students		+		

98	5.	information about employment opportunities for graduates		+		
99	6.	The management of the EP should provide for a variety of ways to disseminate information, including the media, information networks to inform the general public and interested parties	+			
100	7.	Informing the public should include support and explanation of the national development programs of the country and the system of higher and postgraduate education		+		
101	8.	EI must demonstrate the reflection on the web resource of information that characterizes it as a whole and in the context of educational programs		+		
102	9.	An important factor is the availability of adequate and objective information about the teaching staff of the EP		+		
103	10.	An important factor is informing the public about cooperation and interaction with partners within the framework of the OP		+		
Total by standard			2	8	0	0
TOTAL			16	82	4	0

16 (15.7%) parameter has the position "strong"

82 (80.4%) parameters have a position of "satisfactory"

4 (3.9%) parameters have the position "suggests improvement"

0 (0%) parameters have a position of "unsatisfactory"

